

2016 BRICS Goa Summit Final Compliance Report

17 October 2016 to 14 August 2017

Prepared by:

Alissa Wang, Brittaney Warren and the BRICS Research Group
at the University of Toronto

and

Irina Popova, Andey Shelepov and Andrei Sakharov
and the Center for International Institutions Research
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,
Moscow

29 August 2017

Contents

Research Team	3
University of Toronto Research Team.....	3
Country Specialists	3
Compliance Analysts	3
RANEPA Team.....	3
Introduction and Summary	5
Methodology and Scoring System	5
The Breakdown of Commitments.....	6
Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments across Issue Areas, 2009-2016.....	8
Selection of Commitments.....	8
Table 2: 2016 BRICS Goa Summit Priority Commitments.....	9
Compliance Scores.....	10
Table 3: 2016 Goa Summit Final Compliance Scores	10
Compliance Trends.....	10
Table 4: BRICS Compliance Scores, 2011-2016	11
1. Trade: E-commerce	12
2. Development: African Union	18
3. Terrorism: International Cooperation	24
4. Corruption: International Cooperation	31
5. Health: Anti-Microbial Resistance.....	39
6. Macroeconomic Policy: Global Value Chains.....	48
7. Tax: Automatic Exchange of Information.....	55
8. Regional Security: Afghanistan	62
9. Climate Change: Natural Gas.....	68
10: Information and Communications Technologies.....	75

Research Team

Dr. Marina Larionova, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Professor John Kirton, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Brittaney Warren, Researcher, BRICS Research Group
Alissa Xinhe Wang, Chair, Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group
Irina Popova, Moscow team leader

University of Toronto Research Team

Country Specialists

Russia Specialist: Yael Kogan
India Specialist: Nishita Agrawal
South Africa Specialist: Courtney Hallink

Compliance Analysts

Isra Batool
Jamie Chen
Courtney Hallink
Angela Hou
Doris Li
Saakshi Lunkad
Renata Ma
Chinweizu Okeke
Jiayang Shan
Guangquan Shen
Wing Ka Tsang

RANEPA Team

Alexander Ignatov
Evgeny Tsarik
Ildar Khalilyulin
Kirill Krivosheev
Elizaveta Nekrasova
Irina Popova
Irina Sedova
Maria Strelnikova
Sofia Streltsova

Preface

The BRICS Research Group has been assessing progress made by the BRICS members in implementing commitments their leaders make at each summit since the Sanya 2011 meeting. These reports monitor each member's efforts to implement a carefully chosen selection of the many commitments produced at each summit. They are offered to the general public and to policy makers, academics, civil society, the media and interested citizens around the world in an effort to make the BRICS's work more transparent, accessible and effective, and to provide scientific data to enable the meaningful analysis of the causes of compliance and the impact of this important informal international institution. Previous reports are available at the BRICS Information Centre at <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/compliance> and at the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration available at <http://www.ranepa.ru/eng/ciir-ranepa/research-areas/brics/analytics>.

This draft of the final report analyses compliance performance on 10 priority commitments drawn from the total of 45 made by the leaders at the Summit on 15-16 October 2016. It covers actions taken during the period from 17 October 2016 to 14 August 2017.

To make its assessments, the BRICS Research Group relies on publicly available information, documentation and media reports. To ensure accuracy, comprehensiveness and integrity, we encourage comments from stakeholders. Indeed, scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available. All feedback remains anonymous. Responsibility for the contents of this report lies exclusively with the authors and analysts of the BRICS Research Group.

John Kirton and Marina Larionova
Co-directors, BRICS Research Group

Introduction and Summary

The 2016 BRICS Goa Summit Final Compliance Report, prepared by the BRICS Research Group (based at the University of Toronto and the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA), analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with a selection of priority commitments drawn from the total of 45 commitments made by the leaders at the Goa Summit on 15-16 October 2016. The report covers actions on ten commitments taken by the BRICS countries during the period from 17 October 2016 to 31 August 2017.

The role of the BRICS in the global governance system is steadily increasing, as the countries have transformed a purely economic concept of the BRIC into a new global governance institution. Also, in spite of the recent economic slowdown, the BRICS countries collectively constitute almost a third of the global gross domestic product and are likely to outperform the G7 for the next several years.

However, to stay relevant in the global economy and retain its influence, the BRICS needs to further augment cooperation. In line with this idea, the five members have been broadening and deepening their coordination and collaboration in different areas and in different formats. Since the establishment of the format, the countries have held almost 160 meetings at different levels. Apart from the summits, these include the meetings of the foreign, finance, trade, agriculture and health ministers, as well as representatives of statistical offices, competition authorities and heads of development banks. These meetings resulted in the adoption of almost 60 documents and establishment of a growing number of working groups, contact groups and other mechanisms of coordination. The dynamics of BRICS cooperation has been positive, and the speed of its institutionalization has been high. At the summits between 2009 and 2016, BRICS leaders adopted 406 commitments and delegated more than 30 mandates to intra-BRICS institutions.¹ BRICS decisions pertain to 12 broad policy areas, such as economy, finance, climate change and education. The Ufa Summit produced by far the largest number of commitments reaching 130 pledges, but in Goa it decreased considerably to 45 commitments.

Methodology and Scoring System

This report traces BRICS compliance with selected commitments made at the 2016 Goa Summit. It draws on the methodology developed by the G8 Research Group, which has been monitoring G8 compliance since 1996. Since 2008 the same methodology has been adopted for monitoring G20 performance. The use of this time-tested methodology provides for cross-institutional, cross-member and cross-issue consistency and thus allows compatibility and comparability of the compliance performance by different summit institutions and establishes a foundation for evidence-based assessment of the effectiveness of these institutions.² The methodology uses a scale from -1 to +1,

¹ A commitment is defined as a discrete, specific, publicly expressed, collectively agreed statement of intent; a promise by summit members that they will undertake future action to move toward, meet or adjust to an identified target. More details are contained in the Compliance Coding Manual (available at <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/compliance-coding-manual-2016.pdf>).

² Informal summity institutions are defined as international institutions with limited membership, relatively low bureaucracy and reliance on open, flexible and voluntary approaches. Regular meetings of the heads of states and governments who engage on a wide range of international, regional and domestic politics stand at the pinnacle of such international arrangements, which involve many actors operating according to established procedures on two levels: domestic and international. Commitments contained in the collectively agreed documents are not legally-binding but their implementation is stimulated by peer pressure. Among such bodies engaged in global and regional governance are G7/G8, G20, BRICS, APEC and others.

where +1 indicates full compliance with the stated commitment, -1 indicates a failure to comply or action taken that is directly opposite to the stated goal of the commitment, and 0 indicates partial compliance or work in progress, such as initiatives that have been launched but are not yet near completion and whose final results can therefore not be assessed. Each member receives a score of -1, 0 or +1 for each commitment. For convenience, the scientific scores reported in the tables in this summary have been converted to percentages, where -1 equals 0% and +1 equals 100%.³

The Breakdown of Commitments

The number of concrete commitments made by the BRICS leaders at their summits has increased steadily. There were 15 commitments in the 2009 Joint Statement of BRIC Leaders, with five in the area of energy and three related to overcoming the food crisis and establishing favourable conditions for agriculture development. At the 2010 summit, BRIC leaders made 31 commitments. As the agenda expanded decisions were made in new areas: nine commitments on energy, three on finance, five on development cooperation, three on trade, and two on global financial architecture reform and the institutionalization of intra-BRICS cooperation. There were 38 commitments made at the 2011 Sanya Summit: six on environmental protection and adaptation to climate change, and five each on macroeconomic issues, trade and international cooperation. For the first time the BRICS leaders made commitments on public health, human rights, accountability and combating terrorism. The 2012 Delhi Summit issued 32 commitments with a focus on trade (nine commitments), regional security (four commitments) and development assistance (three commitments), but none on financial regulation. The 2013 Durban Summit again produced no commitments on finance and was dominated by the South African presidency's priorities of development, regional security and international institutional reform.

At the Fortaleza Summit in 2014, the BRICS leaders agreed on 68 commitments, the highest number to that time. They covered all the priorities addressed by the previous presidencies. Moreover, the leaders reiterated their commitments on financial regulation, food and agriculture, science, information and communication, and cooperation in culture. They also made commitments in the new areas of environmental protection and anti-corruption.

The 2015 Ufa Summit marked beginning of the NDB and CRA operations. The leaders expressed their expectation that the NDB would approve its inaugural investment projects in early 2016. In the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, the leaders directed their relevant ministries and agencies to take practical steps for efficient implementation and to assess the feasibility of developing a roadmap for BRICS trade, economic and investment cooperation for the period until 2020. They confirmed their commitment to the post-2015 Sustainable Development Goals and to South-South cooperation. For the first time in many years, the leaders' declaration made pledges on health. BRICS members agreed to work together in areas such as managing risks related to emerging infectious diseases with pandemic potential and eradicating communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, neglected tropical diseases, poliomyelitis and measles.

In Goa the leaders reiterated the determination to use all policy tools — monetary, fiscal, and structural, individually and collectively, to achieve the goal of strong, sustainable, balanced and inclusive growth. On energy they expressed support for a wider use of natural gas as an economically efficient and clean fuel.

³ The formula to convert a score into a percentage is $P=50 \times (S+1)$, where P is the percentage and S is the score.

They agreed to strengthen joint efforts to enhance security in the use of ICTs, combating the use of ICTs for criminal and terrorist purposes and improving cooperation between technical, law enforcement, R&D and innovation in the field of ICTs and capacity building institutions. Last but not least they confirmed commitment for cooperation among health and/or regulatory authorities, with a view to share best practices and discuss challenges, as well as identify potential areas for convergence

The commitments of the BRICS, as a group of major emerging economies, fall mainly into the areas relevant for the five countries (see Table 1). In particular, members' priorities for stimulating domestic economic recovery are reflected in the large share of trade and development commitments. Decisions on international cooperation and the reform of international institutions, which remain at the core of the BRICS agenda, also constitute a substantial share at about 10% of the total. At the same time, each presidency strives to incorporate its own priorities in the agenda and can thus substantially influence the breakdown of commitments. For instance, decisions made during the Russian presidency in 2009 focused mainly on energy and agriculture. In 2010 Brasilia retained energy as a top priority and also added development issues to the agenda. The 2011 summit in China shifted toward climate change. The 2012 Indian and 2013 South African presidencies considered regional security as a priority, with the Durban Summit also addressing development issues including infrastructure development and regional integration.

Brazil's 2014 presidency retained the BRICS focus on trade, international cooperation, development and finance, while for the first time paying increased attention to socio-economic issues. Russia's 2015 presidency enhanced cooperation with other international institutions and agreed on specific measures in the areas of food and agriculture, ICT and crime and corruption. India's presidency concentrated on institutionalization of BRICS cooperation and extension of people-to-people contacts, holding about a hundred of various events in different fields, including cultural, scientific and sporting.

Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments across Issue Areas, 2009-2016

Issue Area	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Energy	5	9	1	2				
Finance		3	1			6	6	5
Climate change		1	6	3	1	1	1	1
Macroeconomic policy		1	5	1	5	7	6	4
Trade		3	5	9	4	4	5	2
International cooperation	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7
Socioeconomic	1	1	3	2		7	5	2
Development	1	5	1	3	10	4	4	2
Natural disasters	1	1	1					
Food and agriculture	3		1	1		1	17	
ICT			2			1	17	3
Science and education	1	1	1			2	5	
Health			1	1		1	6	2
Human rights			1		1	2	5	
Accountability			1					
Regional security	1		1	4	8	6	6	4
Terrorism			1	1	2	2	1	4
Culture		1				3	1	2
Sport		1						
IFI Reform	1	2	1	2	9	8	3	2
Nonproliferation					1			1
Crime and corruption						4	10	3
Environment						1	1	1
Tourism							1	
Total	15	31	38	32	47	68	130	45

Notes: IFI = international financial institution; ICT = information and communications technology

Selection of Commitments

For each compliance cycle (that is, the period between summits), the research team selects commitments that reflect the breadth of the BRICS agenda and the priorities of the summit's host, while balancing the selection to allow for comparison with past and future summits.⁴ The selection also takes into account the breakdown of issue areas and the proportion of commitments in each one. The primary criteria for selecting a priority commitment for assessment are the comprehensiveness and relevance to the summit, the BRICS and the world. Selected commitments must meet secondary criteria such as measurability and ability to comply within a year. The tertiary criteria include significance, as identified by relevant stakeholders in the host country and scientific teams. Of the total of 45 commitments made at the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS Research Group has selected ten priority commitments for its compliance assessment (see Table 2).

⁴ Guidelines for choosing priority commitments, as well as other applicable considerations, are available in the Compliance Coding Manual.

Table 2: 2016 BRICS Goa Summit Priority Commitments

Priority Area	Commitment
Trade: E-commerce	We support efforts aimed at capacity building for effective participation in e-commerce trade to ensure shared benefits.
Development: African Union	[We welcome the African Union's (AU) vision, aspirations, goals and priorities for Africa's development enshrined in Agenda 2063, which is complementary with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.] We reaffirm our support for Africa's implementation of its various programmes in pursuit of its continental agenda for peace and socio economic development.
Terrorism: International cooperation	We agreed to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism both at the bilateral level and at international fora.
Corruption: International cooperation	We support the strengthening of international cooperation against corruption, including through the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, as well as on matters related to asset recovery and persons sought for corruption
Health: Anti-microbial resistance	[We welcome the High Level meeting on Anti-Microbial Resistance (AMR) during UNGA-71, which addresses the serious threat that AMR poses to public health, growth and global economic stability.] We will seek to identify possibilities for cooperation among our health and/or regulatory authorities, with a view to share best practices and discuss challenges, as well as identifying potential areas for convergence
Macroeconomic policy: Global value chains	We agree to work for greater integration of MSMEs in Regional and Global Value Chains
Tax: automatic exchange of information	We reaffirm our commitment to support international cooperation in this regard [in accordance with the principle that profit should be taxed in the jurisdiction where the economic activity is performed and the value is created], including in the Common Reporting Standard for Automatic Exchange of Tax Information (AEOI).
Regional security: Afghanistan	We affirm support to the efforts of the Afghan Government to achieve Afghan-led and Afghan-owned national reconciliation and combat terrorism, and readiness for constructive cooperation in order to facilitate security in Afghanistan, promote its independent political and economic course, becoming free from terrorism and drug trafficking
Climate change: Natural gas	We support a wider use of natural gas as an economically efficient and clean fuel to promote sustainable development as well as to reduce the greenhouse emissions in accordance with the Paris Agreement on climate change.
Information and communications technologies	We affirm our commitment to bridging digital and technological divides, in particular between developed and developing countries

Compliance Scores

The overall compliance has been high, with all scores except the one for regional security distributed from 0 to +1. The highest level of compliance (+1 or 100%) was registered for four commitments in the areas of Macroeconomic Policy, Trade, Automatic exchange of tax information and ICT. BRICS compliance performance on macroeconomic policy and trade confirms the group's commitment to advance economic growth. BRICS average score for compliance with the commitments on Climate change and Terrorism reached +0.80 (90%). They were followed by the commitment on Corruption and Development each with +0.60 (80%) and Health with +0.40 (70%). These scores indicate the BRICS's adherence to inclusive growth.

The score for the commitment on Regional Security was the lowest at -0.20 (40%). Regional Security has always been a priority on the BRICS agenda. However, most of the countries have not taken actions to support Afghanistan in addressing the three areas of security, socio-economic and good-governance challenges.

Thus, for the period from 17 October 2016 to 31 August 2017, the BRICS countries achieved an average final compliance score of +0.70, which translates into 85%. The final compliance scores by commitment are contained in Table 3.

Table 3: 2016 Goa Summit Final Compliance Scores

		Brazil	Russia	India	China	South Africa	Average	
1	Trade: E-commerce	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
2	Development: African Union	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
3	Terrorism: International cooperation	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
4	Corruption: International cooperation	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.80	90%
5	Health: Antimicrobial resistance	0	0	0	+1	+1	+0.40	70%
6	Macroeconomic policy: Global value chains	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
7	Tax: Automatic exchange of information	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
8	Regional Security: Afghanistan	-1	0	+1	0	-1	-0.20	40%
9	Climate change: Natural gas	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.80	90%
10	Information and communications technologies	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
	Average	+0.70	+0.80	+0.90	+0.90	+0.60	+0.78	89%
		85%	90%	95%	95%	80%		

Compliance Trends

This is the sixth BRICS compliance report produced by the BRICS Research Group (see Table 4). The 2012 Delhi Summit, at +0.28 or 64%, was a dip between the 2011 Sanya and 2013 Durban summits both at +0.48 or 74%. The 2014 Fortaleza Summit achieved a score of +0.40 (70%), close to the average for all five summits assessed (+0.48 or 74%). The average score for compliance with the Ufa Summit commitments was +0.56 or 78%. The average compliance score for the Goa Summit is the highest in history, at +0.70 (85%). This trends proves the increasing role of BRICS for members' socio-economic policies and global governance in general.

Although the time span is too short to draw strong conclusions on trends, preliminary patterns can be identified with the caveat that assessed commitments in the same issue areas are not identical from one summit to the next.

Given this constraint, the analysis reveals that the BRICS countries complied well with macroeconomic policies commitments (+0.73 or 87%) showing the highest average level. High scores are also registered in other areas which constitute the core of BRICS agenda — support to development (+0.57 or 78%) and fighting terrorism (+0.55 or 78%). Moreover, BRICS members comply well with the new commitments on Information and Communications Technologies (+0.90 or 95%). Performance on regional security issues is uneven, with an overall average of -0.20 (40%).

Table 4: BRICS Compliance Scores, 2011-2016

	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	Average	
Trade	+0.40	0	+1.00	-1.00		+1.00	+0.28	64%
Development	+0.60	+0.40	+0.60	+0.80	+0.40	+1.00	+0.63	82%
Macroeconomic policies			+0.20		+1.00	+1.00	+0.73	87%
Financial regulation	+0.40			+0.20	+1.00	+1.00	+0.70	85%
Climate change	+0.80	+0.20				+0.80	+0.60	80%
International financial institution reform	+0.20	+0.20					+0.20	60%
Energy		+0.60					+0.60	80%
Regional security			+0.20	+0.20	-0.40	-0.20	-0.20	40%
Terrorism			+0.40	+0.60	+0.80	+0.80	+0.65	83%
Environment				+1.00			+1.00	100%
Human rights				+0.60	+0.20		+0.40	70%
Crime and corruption				+0.80		+0.60	+0.70	85%
Information and communications technology					+0.80	+1.00	+0.90	95%
Food and agriculture					+0.80		+0.80	90%
Health						+0.40	+0.40	70%
Average	+0.48	+0.28	+0.48	+0.40	+0.56	+0.78	+0.50	75%
	74%	64%	74%	70%	78%	89%		

1. Trade: E-commerce

2016-41: We support efforts aimed at capacity building for effective participation in e-commerce trade to ensure shared benefits.

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total	+1.00		

Background

In 2013, e-commerce was listed as a formal priority of the BRICS Trade and Investment Cooperation Frame by BRICS trade ministers. In 2015, China and Russia proposed the Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, “a non-binding, ‘living’ document [that takes] into account the domestic regulatory regimes of the BRICS countries.”⁵ The Framework recognized that e-commerce “is playing an increasingly important role in modern trade by generating employment, transforming and upgrading traditional industries, stimulating domestic demands, and facilitating global trade and investment growth and promoting supply chain efficiency.”⁶ The BRICS began to attach great importance to e-commerce cooperation as a way to boost trade and economic ties.

The BRICS recognized several challenges associated with e-commerce including development of regulatory frameworks, investor and participant confidence, security, intra-BRICS compatibility, language barriers, the participation of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs), etc. The Framework proposed to develop guiding principles based on “openness and transparency, efficiency and mutual trust, voluntarism and consensus [and] a view to [achieve] mutually beneficial outcomes.”⁷

Commitment features

This commitment aims to achieve shared benefits from BRICS e-commerce cooperation. The Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, proposed by Russia and China, identified four major objectives and benefits in cross-border e-commerce cooperation:

- Accelerate development of BRICS e-commerce industry and market
- Address related issues that may hinder e-commerce growth
- Enhance capability of MSMEs to be integrated in international markets and global value chains
- Increase opportunity for the public to access global products⁸

⁵“Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, BRICS Info, December 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2016.<http://www.brics-info.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Ecommerce-cooperation.pdf>

⁶“Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, BRICS Info, December 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2016.<http://www.brics-info.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Ecommerce-cooperation.pdf>

⁷“Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, BRICS Info, December 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2016.<http://www.brics-info.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Ecommerce-cooperation.pdf>

⁸“Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, BRICS Info, December 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2016.<http://www.brics-info.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Ecommerce-cooperation.pdf>

Capacity building is the identified method through which these shared benefits can be achieved. The Framework recommended two classes of actions under capacity-building for e-commerce cooperation:

1. “**Encourage member-countries to conduct capacity-building cooperation** via four tiers, namely, government agencies, business and industrial associations, enterprises, and academia;
2. Support joint **workshops and training programs** on e-commerce, and encourage capacity-building initiatives by those members that are capable to provide more training opportunities.”⁹

To comply with this commitment, the BRICS member country must implement policies or take actions that support capacity building, including for example the suggested capacity-building actions, and also gear policies towards at least one of the stated objectives.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The member country did not take any measures consistent with the suggested capacity-building actions.
0	The member country took measures aimed at capacity-building but the action was not geared specifically towards one of the stated objectives OR The member country took measures towards the achievement of shared benefits but not specifically aimed at capacity building
+1	The member country took measures consistent with at least one of the suggested capacity-building actions AND the action was geared specifically towards at least one of the stated objectives.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on e-commerce.

On 25 October 2016, Brazil’s Consumer Defense Commission approved bill 1660/15 to protect Internet users and e-commerce consumers. The bill aims to increase consumer comfort in e-commerce markets by making the tariff system clearer and introducing measures to protect data and privacy.

On 27 October 2016, Brazil approved revision LC 155/2016 to the Simples Nacional tax regime. The statute raises the maximum gross revenue a firm may earn to be considered a small or micro firm from BRL3,600 to BRL4,800,000, which allows more firms to qualify for small enterprise tax breaks associated with importing and exporting goods. The bill also creates the concept of “investor angels” in support of start-ups and provides aid to small firms who are in debt. Supporting these businesses in importing and exporting goods may ease international transactions, supporting the development of the e-commerce marketplace.

On 1-2 March 2017, the World Trade Organization committee on intellectual property rights met and discussed e-commerce issues. Brazil introduced a document on e-commerce and intellectual property, with a focus on copyright rules and the digital environment. The document called for an

⁹“Framework for BRICS E-commerce Cooperation, BRICS Info, December 2015. Access Date: 10 December 2016.<http://www.brics-info.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Ecommerce-cooperation.pdf>

international discussion on “transparency, balance of rights and obligations and the territoriality of copyright.” Brazil also introduced a document on e-commerce and electronic signatures.¹⁰

On 2 August 2017, the 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers was held in Shanghai, China. BRICS trade ministers approved the BRICS E-commerce Cooperation Initiative and set up a working group on e-commerce. BRICS trade ministers also approved the establishment of a BRICS model e-port network which facilitates BRICS trade and connectivity.¹¹

On 2 August 2017, Brazil and China agreed to a bilateral plan of action to promote trade and cooperation, signed by China’s Minister of Commerce Wang Shouwen and Brazil’s Secretary of Trade and Services, Marcelo Maia. Brazil also reported that the two parties have begun to negotiate a specific action plan for e-commerce.¹²

Brazil took actions towards achieving the shared benefits of e-commerce cooperation and at least one of these actions was aimed specifically at capacity-building.

Thus, Brazil received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jamie Chen

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on e-commerce.

In January 2017, the Russian Government assisted an e-commerce joint venture between Alibaba, the world’s largest retailer, and Sberbank, the largest bank in Russia, with an aim to facilitate cross-border e-commerce activities.¹³ This is an example of government encouragement of capacity-building cooperation between enterprises.

On 1 January 2017, Federal Law No. 475-FZ, an amendment to the Russian Federation Tax Code of December 28, 2016 took into effect. Russian IT companies have since enjoyed preferential tax treatment until 2023 under certain conditions.¹⁴

On 2 August 2017, the 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers was held in Shanghai, China. BRICS trade ministers approved the BRICS E-commerce Cooperation Initiative and set up a working group on e-commerce. BRICS trade ministers also approved the establishment of a BRICS model e-port network which facilitates BRICS trade and connectivity.¹⁵

¹⁰ E-commerce, access to medicines catching on at WTO TRIPS Council, IP Watch (Geneva) 3 March 2017. <https://www.ip-watch.org/2017/03/03/e-commerce-access-medicines-catching-trips-council/>

¹¹ Agreement at BRICS meeting can stimulate Sino-Indian e-commerce, Global Times 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1059344.shtml>

¹² Brazil and China promote trade and cooperation in the services sector, Macauhub 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <https://macauhub.com.mo/2017/08/02/pt-brasil-e-china-fomentam-comercio-e-cooperacao-no-sector-dos-servicos/>

¹³ Why Alibaba wants to start a joint venture with Russia's Sberbank, Russia Beyond the Headlines (Moscow) 20 January 2017. (Access Date: 28 January 2017. http://rbth.com/business/2017/01/20/why-alibaba-wants-to-start-a-joint-venture-with-russias-sberbank_685101

¹⁴ Major Russian legislation changes for 2016, Lexology (London) 23 January 2017. Access Date: 28 January 2017. <http://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=0d7ac4d5-d20d-4b0e-a0a0-6c137bad9f12>

¹⁵ Agreement at BRICS meeting can stimulate Sino-Indian e-commerce, Global Times 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1059344.shtml>

Russia took actions towards achieving the shared benefits of e-commerce cooperation and at least one of these actions was aimed specifically at capacity-building.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Guangquan Shen

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on e-commerce.

On November 7 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi launched the “Indian Handloom Brand” initiative to promote handloom products via Indian e-commerce marketplace Kraftly, which will enable craftspeople to sell products directly to consumers, as well as provide “infrastructural support in marketing, customer acquisition and data analytics.”¹⁶ This initiative increases the capabilities of micro and small businesses to integrate into e-commerce market.

On November 8 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi announced the demonetisation of high-value currency in a live, televised address. The move was welcomed by e-commerce leaders, which made people turn to digital payments instead of cash and facilitate the growth of e-commerce. “The downloads of Paytm wallet, a mobile e-commerce company with a user base of over 150 million has tripled since November 9 2016.”¹⁷

On 30 November 2016, the Ministry of Telecommunication joined the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways to “facilitate the laying of fiber cables to achieve greater digital inclusion.” This initiative will promote the transition to digital banking. The online payment of social benefits is expected to save USD22 billion per year.¹⁸

On 12 December 2016, the Indian government announced plans to subsidize digital payments. The policies include waiving tax on low-value online transactions, cutting off insurance policies and stipulating a 0.75% discount on petrol stations.¹⁹

On 20 December 2016, the Federation of Indian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (FICCI) and the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO) organized the exchange of information on e-commerce and technology development as well as partnership between SMEs in BRICS countries.²⁰ This conference strengthens the cooperation of BRICS members in building e-commerce capabilities.

¹⁶Indian E-commerce Platforms get the support of the Government to Promote Handlooms, Newsgram(Chicago) 7 November 2016. Access Date: 23 January 2017. <http://www.newsgram.com/e-commerce-platform-gets-government-support-to-promote-handlooms/>

¹⁷E-commerce Leaders Welcome Government’s Currency Demonetization, CIO (Bangalore) 9 November 2016. Access Date: 23 January 2017. <http://www.cio.in/news/e-commerce-leaders-welcome-government%E2%80%99s-currency-demonetization>

¹⁸India’s Demonetization: Time for a Digital Economy, The Diplomat (Washington) 1 December 2016. Access Date: 28 January 2017. <http://thediplomat.com/2016/12/indias-demonetization-time-for-a-digital-economy/>

¹⁹India offers subsidies for digital payments, FinExtra(London) 12 December 2016. Access Date: 23 January 2017. <https://www.finextra.com/newsarticle/29890/india-offers-subsidies-for-digital-payments>

²⁰E-commerce fueling optimism among SMEs in BRICS countries, United Nations Industrial Development Organization (New Delhi) 20 December 2016. Access Date: 23 January 2017. <http://www.unido.org/news/press/e-commerce-fueling-o.html>

On 2 August 2017, the 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers was held in Shanghai, China. BRICS trade ministers approved the BRICS E-commerce Cooperation Initiative and set up a working group on e-commerce. BRICS trade ministers also approved the establishment of a BRICS model e-port network which facilitates BRICS trade and connectivity.²¹

India took actions towards achieving the shared benefits of e-commerce cooperation and at least one of these actions was aimed specifically at capacity-building.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Jamie Chen

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on e-commerce.

On 25 October 2016, China's National Development and Reform Commission, announced that the agreement fighting credit manipulation would be part of creating a national "social credit system" aimed at promoting online trustworthiness. To support this initiative, China's largest internet companies including Alibaba, Tencent, JD.com, have agreed to share data with government authorities to eliminate "brushing" — faking reviews and sales figure — for the healthy development of e-commerce.²² This is a capacity building action that supports businesses and enterprises.

On 27 October 2016, China launched the national quality monitoring center for cross-border e-commerce in Hangzhou. The platform is comprised of a big data center to monitor cross-border e-commerce and will serve several functions including risk monitoring, evaluation and treatment, quality source tracing, and credit rating. Wang Yichen, an official from the Hangzhou entry-exit inspection and quarantine bureau, stated that "the center will lower risks concerning commodity quality, protect consumer rights and help create a safer and more trustworthy e-commerce environment."²³

On 2 August 2017, the 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers was held in Shanghai, China. BRICS trade ministers approved the BRICS E-commerce Cooperation Initiative and set up a working group on e-commerce. BRICS trade ministers also approved the establishment of a BRICS model e-port network which facilitates BRICS trade and connectivity.²⁴

On 2 August 2017, Brazil and China agreed to a bilateral plan of action to promote trade and cooperation, signed by China's Minister of Commerce Wang Shouwen and Brazil's Secretary of Trade and Services, Marcelo Maia. Brazil also reported that the two parties have begun to negotiate a specific action plan for e-commerce.²⁵

²¹Agreement at BRICS meeting can stimulate Sino-Indian e-commerce, Global Times 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1059344.shtml>

²²China tech groups to share data with state in online fraud battle, Financial Times (London) 25 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <https://www.ft.com/content/4ebc5fb6-9a70-11e6-8f9b-70e3cabccfae>

²³China cross-border e-commerce quality monitoring center launched, China Daily (Beijing) 27 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/business/2016-10/27/content_27190593.htm

²⁴Agreement at BRICS meeting can stimulate Sino-Indian e-commerce, Global Times 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1059344.shtml>

²⁵Brazil and China promote trade and cooperation in the services sector, Macauhub 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <https://macauhub.com.mo/2017/08/02/pt-brasil-e-china-fomentam-comercio-e-cooperacao-no-sector-dos-servicos/>

China took actions towards achieving the shared benefits of e-commerce cooperation and at least one of these actions was aimed specifically at capacity-building.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alissa Wang

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment on e-commerce.

On 16-18 October 2016, South Africa hosted the fifth meeting of the African Internet Governance Forum (AfIGF). The AfIGF aims to be an “inclusive multilateral, multi-stakeholder and multilingual discussion on issues pertinent to the Internet in African in general and Internet Governance issues in particular.”²⁶ This is a capacity-building action in the form of joint workshops and training programs.

On 12 December 2016, the South African government and the Universal Postal Union agreed to establish an electronic commerce hub. The e-commerce development of the postal service will be given top priority as it aligns with modernizing South Africa according to South Africa’s Minister of Telecommunication and Postal Services Dr. Siyabonga Cwele. The establishment of e-commerce between the Postal Union and the government is to develop e-commerce in the Southern region of Africa which has the most developed internet and mobile telecommunication infrastructure in the country.²⁷

On 2 August 2017, the 7th Meeting of the BRICS Trade Ministers was held in Shanghai, China. BRICS trade ministers approved the BRICS E-commerce Cooperation Initiative and set up a working group on e-commerce. BRICS trade ministers also approved the establishment of a BRICS model e-port network which facilitates BRICS trade and connectivity.²⁸

South Africa took actions towards achieving the shared benefits of e-commerce cooperation and at least one of these actions were aimed specifically at capacity-building.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Wing Ka Tsang

²⁶The AfIGF, African Internet Governance Forum (Durban). Access Date: 13 November 2016.

<http://afigf.org/?q=TheAfIGF>

²⁷Universal Postal Union, UPU, South Africa discuss regional e-commerce hub, Universal Postal Union (Berne) 2 December 2016. Access Date: 27 January 2017. http://news.upu.int/no_cache/nd/upu-south-africa-discuss-regional-e-commerce-hub/

²⁸Agreement at BRICS meeting can stimulate Sino-Indian e-commerce, Global Times 2 August 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1059344.shtml>

2. Development: African Union

2016-9: “[We welcome the African Union’s (AU) vision, aspirations, goals and priorities for Africa’s development enshrined in Agenda 2063, which is complementary with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.] We reaffirm our support for Africa’s implementation of its various programmes in pursuit of its continental agenda for peace and socio economic development.”

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total		+1.00	

Background

At the 2010 Brasilia Summit, development issues were added to the agenda for the first time with numerous commitments made towards the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The only development commitment made at the 2011 Summit was a commitment to promote “infrastructure development in Africa ... within the framework of the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD)” programme.²⁹

At the 2012 New Delhi summit, along with a recommitment to the 2011 development goals, a commitment was made to considering the possibility of setting up a new Development Bank to “to supplement the existing efforts of multilateral and regional financial institutions for global growth and development.”³⁰ The 2013 Durban Summit had development as a central focus, especially regarding the African continent, with multiple commitments made within the NEPAD framework. The BRICS also committed to the establishment of a New Development Bank, in addition to renewing prior commitments to the MDG.³¹ In 2014 the BRICS leaders reiterated their commitment to African development, as they called for increased BRICS-Africa cooperation.

This year’s development commitment to the African continent is framed in the context of the African Union’s (AU) Agenda 2063 and the United Nations’ 2030 SDG Agenda. The goals of the 2063 Agenda are:

1. A prosperous Africa based on inclusive growth and sustainable development
2. An integrated continent, politically united and based on the ideals of Pan-Africanism and the vision of Africa’s Renaissance
3. An Africa of good governance, democracy, respect for human rights, justice and the rule of law
4. A peaceful and secure Africa
5. An Africa with a strong cultural identity, common heritage, shared values and ethics

²⁹ "Action Plan." BRICS Sanya Declaration, 2011. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>.

³⁰ "Action Plan." BRICS New Delhi Declaration, 2012. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

³¹ "Statement by BRICS Leaders on the Establishment of BRICS-Led Development Bank".

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-brics-bank.html>

6. An Africa whose development is people-driven, relying on the potential of African people, especially its women and youth, and caring for children
7. Africa as a strong, united and influential global player and partner

Commitment Features

Support entails the provision of financial support, technical assistance, or an act of cooperation with the AU or a third party with the objective of supporting AU programmes to foster the implementation of the 2063 Agenda. Cooperation can take the form of a formal political agreement, association, or Memorandum of Understanding. Legitimate acts of cooperation are not excluded to BRICS member and the African Union or its affiliates. An act of cooperation between a BRICS member and a third party, either a state or international organization, with the objective of supporting AU programmes with the implementation of the 2063 Agenda, is also considered a form of support and can contribute to a score of full compliance.

Some of the AU programmes that target the implementation of the 2063 Agenda include, but are not limited to, the following:

- New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD)
- African Union Border Programme
- Disarmament Demobilization Reintegration (DDR)
- African Peace and Security Architecture (APSA)

The commitment states that the BRICS member will provide support for “various programmes.” Thus, for the purposes of this compliance report, support for more than one programme is required in order to receive a score of full compliance. The programmes supported must also further the implementation of the 2063 Agenda and its goals. If the BRICS member has provided support to one AU programme that is targeted towards achieving the goals of the 2063 Agenda, a score of partial compliance will be awarded.

If the BRICS member has not provided, continued, or renewed support to any AU programmes that are targeted towards achieving the goals of the 2063 Agenda, a score of non-compliance will be awarded. If the BRICS member has made a verbal declaration of support for any of the AU programmes but has not provided any other form of support to any AU programmes that are targeted towards achieving the goals of the 2063 Agenda, a score of non-compliance will be awarded.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member has not provided, continued, or renewed support to one or more AU programmes in pursuit of implementing the 2063 Agenda.
0	The BRICS member has provided, continued, or renewed support to one AU programme in pursuit of implementing the 2063 Agenda.
+1	The BRICS member has provided, continued, or renewed support to two or more AU programmes in the pursuit of implementing the 2063 Agenda.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment on development.

No actions of compliance were found during the compliance period.

On 31 October 2016, The Constitution and Justice and Citizenship Commission approved the Draft Legislative Decree (PDC 432/16) establishing an agreement for cooperation and facilitation of investments between the Government of Brazil and Angola. The proposal encourages reciprocal investment between the two governments and allows greater dissemination of business opportunities, exchange of information on regulatory frameworks, guarantees for investment and adequate mechanisms for the prevention and settlement of disputes.³²

On 30 January 2017, the Mozambican Government signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the National Council of Institutions of the Federal Network of Professional, Scientific and Technological Education of Brazil. It is an instrument that should serve to exchange work experiences between the parties and promote the exchange of regulations, material and specialists in Professional, Scientific and Technological Education.³³

On 27-28 April 2017, In the context of the meeting of the Brazil-Tunisia Joint Commission held in Brasilia the Director of the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC) received the Tunisian Chancellor to jointly analyze the expansion of cooperation between the two countries. Possible themes for technical cooperation initiatives include support for capacity building in the areas of: rural extension of family farmers; Small and medium-sized enterprises; and health.³⁴

On 8-12 May 2017, a Brazilian delegation composed of representatives of the Ministry of Health (MS), the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC) and the Oswaldo Cruz Foundation (Fiocruz) carried out a prospection mission for the new phase of the Human Milk Bank in Cabo Verde. The objective was to subsidize the negotiation between the Brazilian government and the Cabo Verdean government for the expansion and strengthening of the Human Milk Bank in the African country.³⁵

On June 6 2017, the Guiné-Bissau Professional Training Center, which started its activities in the country in 2006, held another graduation ceremony for its students, which was attended by the Minister of Public Administration, Reform administrative and Labor of Guinea-Bissau, Tumane Baldé, the Secretary General of the Presidency, Cesar Augusto Vieira Fernandes of Brazil and Ambassador in the country, Fernando Apparicio da Silva. The "Vocational Training Centers" project launched by Brazil aims to equip the government of the partner countries with a vocational training structure, which includes the construction of adequate infrastructure and the training of trainers, trainers and managers. The chosen areas, which are always defined together with the partner countries, cover sectors such as Automobile mechanics, Installation and repair of computers, Construction, Cutting and Sewing, among others, thus qualifying the local workforce.³⁶

³² Cooperação para investimentos entre Brasil e Angola vai a Plenário, Deputies Chamber of Brazil 31 October 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www2.camara.leg.br/camaranoticias/noticias/RELACOES-EXTERIORES/518628-COOPERACAO-PARA-INVESTIMENTOS-ENTRE-BRASIL-E-ANGOLA-VAI-A-PLENARIO.html>

³³ Moçambique e Brasil: Formalizada Cooperação no Domínio de Educação Profissional, Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education of Mozambique 30 January 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.mctestp.gov.mz/?q=content/mo%C3%A7ambique-e-brasil-formalizada-coopera%C3%A7%C3%A3o-no-dom%C3%ADnio-de-educa%C3%A7%C3%A3o-profissional>

³⁴ Brasil e Tunísia fortalecem laços de cooperação Sul-Sul, Brazilian Agency for Cooperation 29 April 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarConteudo/716>

³⁵ Brasil e Cabo Verde negociam nova fase de Projeto de Banco de Leite Humano, Brazilian Agency for Cooperation 12 May 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarConteudo/721>

³⁶ "Centro de Formação Profissional" realiza cerimônia de formatura na Guiné-Bissau, Brazilian Agency for Cooperation 7 June 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarConteudo/738>

On 12-19 June 2017, the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC) and the Brazilian Agricultural Research Corporation (Embrapa) organized a training on the control of the caterpillar *Spodoptera frugiperda* which has seriously damaged cotton production in several African countries since last year. This training was designed for representatives of Benin, Burkina Faso, Mali, Chad and Togo.³⁷

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Chinweizu Okeke

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment on development.

On 18 March 2017, Russia and Ethiopia signed a Memorandum of Understanding on Tourism and Culture and Protocol of the Intergovernmental Commission on Economic, Scientific, Technical and Trade Cooperation. This led to an agreement to boost cooperation in trade and investment, industry, education and agriculture.³⁸

On 11 August 2017, Russia published a government resolution outlining its plans to sign a military cooperation deal with Niger focused on terrorism and international security. The two sides will negotiate an agreement with the aim of strengthening international security and consolidating African communities.³⁹

Russia provided support in the form of economic cooperation and security cooperation with a third party, contributing to the implementation of the 2063 Agenda.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Jiayang Shan

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment on development.

On 11 January 2017, Kenyan President Uhuru Kenyatta visited India. During the talks, the Kenya and India decided to deepen economic cooperation and identified the expansion of bilateral trade as a priority. They also agreed to operationalize defence, medical, security, and counterterrorism cooperation. India announced a USD100 million Line of Credit to Kenya for agricultural mechanization.⁴⁰

On 21 February 2017, Indian Vice-President Shri Hamid Ansari met Rwandan President Paul Kagame during a three-day state visit. They discussed strengthening relations, especially in trade. The two countries signed a Memorandum of Understanding on the establishment of an Entrepreneurship Development Center, an agreement for the visa requirement exemptions, and a bilateral air service agreement. India also committed to a USD120 million credit line for the development of an

³⁷ Brasil apoia a África no combate à lagarta do cartucho, Brazilian Agency for Cooperation 20 June 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarConteudo/758>

³⁸ Ethiopia, Russia sign MoU, Protocol Agreement, Africa News 18 March 2017.

<http://www.africanews.com/2017/03/18/ethiopia-russia-sign-mou-protocol-agreement/>

³⁹ Russia plans military cooperation deal with Niger, Africa Times 11 August 2017. Access date 11 August 2017.

<https://africatimes.com/2017/08/11/tass-report-russia-plans-military-cooperation-deal-with-niger/>

⁴⁰ India announces \$100 million Line of Credit to Kenya, The Hindu (Chennai) 11 January 2017.

<http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/India-announces-100-million-Line-of-Credit-to-Kenya/article17023281.ece>

agriculture project. India also announced the provision of 100 tonnes of medicines worth USD2 million and a cash grant of USD1 million to secure medical equipment from India.⁴¹

India provided support in the form of economic cooperation, financial assistance, medical assistance, and agricultural cooperation with third parties, contributing to implementing the 2063 Agenda.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Chinweizu Okeke

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment on development.

On 28 November 2016, the Chinese government donated USD1.2 million to the Africa Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM) which will be used towards peace effort in Somalia.⁴² The Commissioner for Peace and Security indicated that the donation comes at a critical moment when AMISOM needs additional support for its engagement in Somalia.⁴³

On 29-30 November 2016, Chinese representatives participated in a Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue held by the Africa-China Dialogue Platform to discuss China's engagement with Zambia. The main theme of the conference is achieving the SDGs and the 2063 Agenda.⁴⁴

On 6 March 2017, during the Fifth Session of the 12th National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference, China proposed to increase its medical assistance to African countries as one of many ways that China plans to strengthen its relations with the continent.⁴⁵

On 9 March 2017, Chinese Foreign Minister Wang Yi announced that China will continue to strengthen relations with Africa, and that nearly USD30 billion has been disbursed since the Johannesburg Summit in 2015. He also stated that the completion of the Mombasa-Nairobi railway was expected soon and that projects were underway in Congo and Tanzania. He also stated that Chinese support for Africa gives the continent an opportunity to achieve sustainable development.⁴⁶

China provided support in the form of economic cooperation, peace and security cooperation, medical assistance and infrastructure projects with third parties, contributing to the implementation of the 2063 Agenda. Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Jiayang Shan

⁴¹Rwanda, India sign three bilateral deals, New Times (Kigali) 21 February 2017. <http://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/article/2017-02-21/208217/>

⁴²The African Union receives additional financial support from China for the AU Mission in SomaliaAllafrica. 29 November 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2017. <http://allafrica.com/stories/201611290782.html>.

⁴³The African Union receives additional financial support from China for the AU Mission in Somalia, African Union Peace and Security (Addis Ababa). Access Date: 6 March 2017. <http://www.peaceau.org/en/article/the-african-union-receives-additional-financial-support-from-china-for-the-au-mission-in-somalia>.

⁴⁴Africa-China Dialogue Platform, OXFAM International (Lusaka)30 November 2016. Access Date: 1 November 2017. https://oxfamafriacachinadialogueplatform.files.wordpress.com/2017/01/november-edition-of-the-nl_joab-comments-1.pdf

⁴⁵China bolsters ties with Africa, The Herald (Beijing) 6 March 2017. Access date: 6 March 2017. <http://www.herald.co.zw/china-bolsters-ties-with-africa/>

⁴⁶China disburses 30bn to Africa, Africa News 9 March 2017. Acces Date: 9 March 2017. <http://www.africanews.com/2017/03/09/china-disburses-30bn-to-africa/>

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment on development.

South Africa joined the Organization for African Unity (now the African Union) in 1994, shortly after the country's first democratic election.⁴⁷ South Africa is still a member of the African Union today, demonstrating support for the African Union and the implementation of the 2063 Agenda. This act of support for the African Union, however, is only considered as support for one program and therefore can only contribute to a score of partial compliance.

On 27-28 January 2017, President Zuma attended the 28th Ordinary Session of the African Union Executive Council.⁴⁸ The summit emphasized the importance of implementing the African Union's Agenda 2063.⁴⁹ During the summit, however, President Zuma did not pledge any new form of support to the African Union or its existing programs.

On 31 July 2017, South Africa published a press released that reaffirmed its commitment to the 2063 Agenda titled "Create a better South Africa; contribute to a better and safer Africa in a better world." The pres release stated, "in line with the principles of Agenda 2063 of the African Union, South Africa prioritises issues of regional trade and economic integration through a number of entities and policy instruments, such as the Southern African Customs Union and the Southern African Development Community (SADC) Industrialisation Action Plan." The statement outlines that South Africa is "actively involved in the Tripartite Free Trade Area negotiations and the Continental Free Trade Areas," which are aimed at "promoting a developmental integration agenda that combines market integration with industrial and infrastructure development." The press release also states that South Africa is furthering its contributions to the development of Africa by taking over as the chair of the SADC from August 2017 to August 2018, and states that South Africa during its time as chair will ensure the "participation and involvement of the regional private sector in the implementation of the SADC Regional Industrialisation Strategy Roadmap."⁵⁰ The press release also states that South Africa will "continue to contribute to peace and security on the continent as well as maintaining its current commitments to the Africa Union Peace and Security Council."⁵¹

South Africa provided to the implementation of the 2063 Agenda in the form of institutional support, economic and trade cooperation, market integration, infrastructure development, industrialisation, and peace and security cooperation.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Courtney Hallink

⁴⁷ South Africa joins the OAU, South African History Online (Cape Town).Access Date: 7 March 2017, <http://www.sahistory.org.za/dated-event/south-africa-joins-oau>.

⁴⁸ President Zuma returns from a successful AU Summit, SA News, Date of Access: 4 March 2017, <http://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/president-zuma-returns-successful-au-summit>.

⁴⁹ 28th Ordinary Session of the Executive Council, African Union (Addis Ababa)28 January 2017. Access Date: 7 March 2017, <https://www.au.int/en/newsevents/19590/28th-ordinary-session-executive-council>.

⁵⁰South Africa: International Cooperation, Trade and Security Cluster on Work Done in First Quarter of 2017, All Africa 31 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://allafrica.com/stories/201707311020.html>

⁵¹South Africa: International Cooperation, Trade and Security Cluster on Work Done in First Quarter of 2017, All Africa 31 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://allafrica.com/stories/201707311020.html>

3. Terrorism: International Cooperation

2016-29: We agreed to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism both at the bilateral level and at international fora.

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total	+1.00		

Background

At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS countries reiterated the commitments made in previous years regarding combating terrorism by strengthening cooperation. Prior to the 2011 summit, terrorism was not featured in the commitments of the BRICS countries. Post 2011, commitments in this issue area of terrorism grew from 1 in 2011, to 5 in 2015. Since terrorism affecting BRICS countries is mostly prevalent in Afghanistan, aiding the Afghan government to prevent and combat terrorism has been a common commitment made since 2011. This commitment also reiterates the central role of the United Nations in strengthening cooperation to combat international terrorism by increasing effectiveness of its counter terrorism framework.

At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS made a new addition to their standing commitment to combat terrorism by including cooperation at the bilateral level as well as at the international level through international forums. Additionally, a new commitment was made to address the threat of biological and chemical terrorism.

Commitment Features

This commitment calls for the strengthening of cooperation in combating terrorism at a bilateral level and at the international level through international forums. The Goa Declaration reiterates the UN's essential role in combating international terrorism. The BRICS countries undertake their commitment through the UN's counter terrorism framework that outlines all relevant United Nations Security Council Resolutions.

The strengthening of cooperation in combating terrorism must be in accordance with the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy Action Plan. This plan consists of measures divided into four specific areas:

1. Measures to address the conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism
2. Measures to prevent and combat terrorism
3. Measures to build states' capacity to prevent and combat terrorism and to strengthen the role of the United Nations system in this regard
4. Measures to ensure respect for human rights for all and the rule of law as the fundamental basis of the fight against terrorism

5. Combating terrorism (any actions taken in preventing or countering international terrorism in accordance with the principles of the UN Charter and the norms of international law).
6. Denying terrorists access to the means to carry out their attacks, to their targets as well as to the desired impact of their attacks would count towards compliance in this area.⁵²
7. Strengthening cooperation (any action that would enable or encourage working collectively among the BRICS countries, as well as in the international community, to combat terrorism within the aforementioned framework would be in compliance with this commitment area). Cooperation on the trilateral, non-institutional and multilateral levels also count towards international cooperation. Furthermore, bilateral level (in the form of memorandums of understanding, political statements, financial support, and other forms of strategic cooperation in the field of preventing and countering terrorism) with one or several BRICS members (which count towards the strengthening of intra-BRICS cooperation) or with other members of the international community (which count towards the strengthening of international bilateral or multilateral cooperation) is also a form of compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member does not take actions to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism EITHER on a bilateral level OR at international forums.
0	Members take actions to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism on a bilateral level OR at international forums.
+1	Member takes actions to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism both at the bilateral level AND at international forums.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment on terrorism.

On 3 February 2017, Brazil published two administrative regulations on blocking assets of persons convicted of terrorism. The measure aims to prevent the financing and expansion of terrorist activity in the world by focusing on preventing the financing of the terrorist groups.

However, Brazil has not reported any convictions for terrorism or blockage of assets in the name of persons on the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) sanctions lists.⁵³

On 23 March 2017, the director and general coordinator of the Department of Asset Recovery and International Legal Cooperation (DRCI) of the National Secretariat of Justice, Luiz Roberto Ungaretti and Isalino Giacomet Júnior, held a meeting with members of the French Central Authority for international legal cooperation in criminal matters. The meeting followed on from the Plenary Meeting of the Financial Action Task Force against Money Laundering and Terrorism Financing (FATF), held from 19 to 24 February in Paris.⁵⁴

⁵² United Nations Counter Terrorism Implementation Task Force. Access Date: 1 October 2016. <https://www.un.org/counterterrorism/ctitf/en/un-global-counter-terrorism-strategy#plan>

⁵³ BrailGovNews, Government publishes rules on blocking assets of persons convicted of terrorism, 3 February 2017. Date accessed: 25 February 2017. <http://www.brazilgovnews.gov.br/news/2017/02/government-publishes-rules-on-blocking-assets-of-persons-convicted-of-terrorism>

⁵⁴ Brasil e França discutem cooperação jurídica internacional em matéria penal, Ministry of Justice and Public Security of Brazil 23 March 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.justica.gov.br/noticias/em-paris-brasil-e-franca-discutem-cooperacao-juridica-internacional>

On 21 June 2017, Governments of Brazil and Russia signed a declaration and acts of bilateral cooperation to intensify cooperation in key areas for the two countries. The declaration is based on a commitment to the global effort to combat climate change and the implementation of the Paris Agreement, the fight against corruption and terrorism.⁵⁵

On 28 July 2017, BRICS National Security Advisers held their annual security dialogue in Beijing, China, hosted by China's State Councillor Yang Jiechi.⁵⁶ They discussed BRICS cooperation in counter-terrorism, including suggestions that the BRICS countries should "take the lead role in countering global terrorism and address also regional issues."⁵⁷

During the compliance period, actions were taken on both bilateral and the international level.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Renata Ma

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment on terrorism.

On 15 November 2016, President Vladimir Putin and US President-Elect Donald Trump had their first telephone call and agreed to strengthen bilateral ties in the common fight against international terrorism regarding Syria.⁵⁸ Trump is said to look forward in building a better relationship with Russia and to combatting a mutually agreed upon enemy regarding international terrorism. The Presidents discussed the Syrian settlement.⁵⁹

On 16 November 2016, President Vladimir Putin ratified the Russian-Chinese agreement on cooperation on the war on terror. The agreement, signed on 27 September 2010, is a bilateral cooperation in combating terrorism. The agreement also includes written joint agreements in "order to detect and effectively suppress activities connected to planning and carrying out terrorist attacks."⁶⁰

On 1 December 2016, President Vladimir Putin signed the new Foreign Policy Concept replacing the previous Foreign Policy Concept from 2013. The policy calls for the creation of an international

⁵⁵ Governos do Brasil e Rússia assinam declaração e atos de cooperação bilateral, Site of Brazilian President 21 June 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www2.planalto.gov.br/acompanhe-planalto/noticias/2017/06/governos-do-brasil-e-russia-assinam-declaracao-e-atos-de-cooperacao-bilateral>

⁵⁶ BRICS NSAs meet to discuss cooperation in counter-terrorism, Times of India 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/brics-nsas-meet-to-discuss-cooperation-in-counter-terrorism/articleshow/59801610.cms>

⁵⁷ China's Xi calls for more cooperation from BRICS amid standoff with India, Hindustan Times 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/china-s-xi-jinping-calls-for-more-cooperation-from-brics-nations-amid-standoff-with-india/story-1zmk5vICYSx2ZTlJFKTZ4O.html>

⁵⁸ Trump-Putin first phone call: Discuss Syria, US-Russia Relations, trade: "Uniting efforts in fighting terrorism," Global Research (Ottawa) 15 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.globalresearch.ca/trump-putin-first-phone-call-discuss-syria-us-russia-relations-trade-uniting-efforts-in-fighting-terrorism/5556999>

⁵⁹ Vladimir Putin phones Donald Trump to discuss Russia-US relations, terrorism, NBC News (Washington) 14 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.nbcnews.com/politics/2016-election/vladimir-putin-phones-donald-trump-discuss-russia-u-s-relations-n683746>

⁶⁰ Putting ratifies Russia-China anti-terrorism agreement, Russia Beyond The Headlines (Moscow) 22 November 2016. Access Date: 6 February 2017. http://rbth.com/news/2016/11/22/putin-ratifies-russia-china-anti-terrorism-agreement_650011

anti-terrorist coalition and places fighting international terrorism as a top Russian priority. The policy heavily set out the country's standards for international law, arms control and nuclear weapons. The policy proposes the creation of zones that are "free of nuclear weapons and other types of weapons of mass destruction, especially in the Middle East."^{61,62}

On 22 December 2016, China agreed to cooperate with Russia in the fight against international terrorism on a bilateral level in the common interest of security. An official statement reported that, "the Chinese side confirms the intention to develop further cooperation with Russia and the international community in fighting terrorism in interests of common security."⁶³

On 4 January 2017, Russian Ambassador Igor Khovaev announced support and cooperation to share experience and knowledge towards combating terrorism with the Philippines. Russia is willing to offer equipment and staff training, and hold consultations with the Philippines to improve ties between the two countries. However, Russia does not plan to enter into a formal military alliance with the Philippines.⁶⁴

On 12 January 2017, Russia and Turkey signed and agreed on coordinating airstrikes to assist the Syrian military in their fight against ISIS in Syria.⁶⁵

On 1 February 2017, India and Russia agreed on a joint action plan to counter global terrorism according to the External Affairs Ministry, Preeti Saran. This move on deepening relations on counter-terrorism is referenced under the UN, BRICS commitment features.⁶⁶

On 2 March 2017, Moscow hosted a Russian-German interdepartmental counter-terrorism consultation. The officials discussed global and regional terrorism threats, foreign terror militants, and future bilateral counter-terrorism cooperation at international events and through relevant ministries and agencies.⁶⁷

On 7 March 2017, top army generals Hulusi Akar from Turkey, Joseph Dunford from the United States, and Valery Gerasimov from Russia met in Antalya, Turkey to coordinate counter-terrorism

⁶¹ Russia sets out its policy on terrorism, nuclear war & global ties in new Foreign Policy Concept 1, RT (Moscow) December 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://www.rt.com/news/368927-russia-foreign-policy-concept/>

⁶² Russia's new foreign policy concept calls for broad anti-terror coalition, Sputnik (Moscow) 1 December 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://sputniknews.com/politics/201612011048059451-russia-foreign-policy/>

⁶³ Beijing vows to cooperate with Moscow against international terrorism, Tass (Beijing) 22 December 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://tass.com/world/921373>

⁶⁴ Despite warship visit, Russia says not seeking military ties with PH, ABS News (Moscow) 4 January 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://news.abs-cbn.com/news/01/04/17/despite-warship-visit-russia-says-not-seeking-military-ties-with-ph>

⁶⁵ Syria, Turkey, Russia to coordinate counter-terrorism efforts in northern Syria, Global Research (Ottawa) 13 January 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.globalresearch.ca/syria-turkey-russia-to-coordinate-counter-terrorism-efforts-in-northern-syria/5568242>

⁶⁶ India, Russia agree on joint action plan to counter terrorism, Z News (New Delhi) 1 February 2017. Access Date: 6 February 2017. http://zeenews.india.com/india/india-russia-agree-on-joint-action-plan-to-counter-terrorism_1972368.html

⁶⁷ Press release on Russian-German interdepartmental counter-terrorism consultations, The Russia News Now (Moscow) 2 March 2017. Access Date: 8 March 2017. <https://www.therussophile.org/press-release-on-russian-german-interdepartmental-counter-terrorism-consultations.html/>

operations in the Middle East and discuss security challenges and military operations in Syria and Iraq.⁶⁸⁶⁹

On 28 July 2017, BRICS National Security Advisers held their annual security dialogue in Beijing, China, hosted by China's State Councillor Yang Jiechi.⁷⁰ The national security advisers discussed BRICS cooperation in counter-terrorism, including suggestions that the BRICS countries should "take the lead role in countering global terrorism and address also regional issues."⁷¹

During the compliance period, actions were taken on the bilateral and international level.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst Wing Ka Tsang

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment on terrorism.

On 15 November 2016, India and Israel agreed to intensify cooperation in combating radicalism and extremism. Prime Minister Modi said that both he and the Israeli President Rivlin noted the strength of the growing defense partnership and agreed on the need to make their cooperation "more broad-based" through production and manufacturing partnerships.⁷²

On 12 December 2016, India and Indonesia jointly called upon all countries to work towards eliminating terrorist safe havens and infrastructure, disrupting terrorist networks and financing channels, and stopping cross-border terrorism. The two countries also agreed to strengthen defense ties, with a focus on maritime security.⁷³

On 27 January 2017, India and the United Arab Emirates agreed to coordinate efforts to counter radicalisation and the misuse of religion, focusing on states that use religion to sponsor and sustain terrorism against other countries.⁷⁴

On 1 February 2017, India and Russia reaffirmed their intention to continue working together to curb threats to national security posed by terrorism, including state-sponsored, cross-border terrorism faced by India.⁷⁵

⁶⁸Turkish, US, Russia's top general discuss counter terrorism in Mideast, Kuwait News Agency (Kuwait City) 7 March 2017. Access Date: 8 March 2017. <http://www.kuna.net.kw/ArticleDetails.aspx>

⁶⁹Turkish, Russia, U.S. generals meet to discuss tensions over Syria operations, Toronto Star (Toronto) 7 March 2017. Access Date: March 25, 2017 <https://www.thestar.com/news/world/2017/03/07/turkish-russia-us-generals-meet-to-discuss-tensions-over-syria-operations.html>

⁷⁰BRICS NSAs meet to discuss cooperation in counter-terrorism, Times of India 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/brics-nsas-meet-to-discuss-cooperation-in-counter-terrorism/articleshow/59801610.cms>

⁷¹China's Xi calls for more cooperation from BRICS amid standoff with India, Hindustan Times 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/china-s-xi-jinping-calls-for-more-cooperation-from-brics-nations-amid-standoff-with-india/story-1zmk5viCYSx2ZTljFKT4O.html>

⁷²India, Egypt to Step up Defence, Anti-terror Cooperation - Times of India, The Times of India (New Delhi) 2 September 2016. Access Date: 5 January 2017.

⁷³ India, Indonesia Boost Anti-terror Efforts, The Indian Express (New Delhi) 13 December 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017.

⁷⁴India, UAE to Coordinate Efforts to Counter Misuse of Religion for Inciting Hatred, The Hindu (New Delhi) 27 January 2017. Access Date: 6 March. 2017.

On 28 July 2017, BRICS National Security Advisers held their annual security dialogue in Beijing, China, hosted by China's State Councillor Yang Jiechi.⁷⁶ The national security advisers discussed BRICS cooperation in counter-terrorism, including suggestions that the BRICS countries should "take the lead role in countering global terrorism and address also regional issues."⁷⁷

During the compliance period, actions were taken on the bilateral and international level.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Saakshi Lunkad

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment on terrorism.

On 27 September 2016, China and Belgium agreed to work together in strengthening law enforcement and security cooperation, and to address the threat of terrorism.⁷⁸

On 28 September 2016, China and India agreed to enhance law enforcement cooperation to fight cross-border terrorist attacks amid increasing threat to the region. Both sides reached consensus on practical measures in coping with the threat.⁷⁹

On 11 November 2016, the Russian State Duma ratified an agreement between China and Russia. The agreement aims to develop bilateral cooperation in combating terrorism, separatism and extremism by taking joint measures to prevent and stop terrorist attacks.⁸⁰

On 13 December 2016, at the United Nations Security Council, Chinese ambassador Wu Haitao stated that the international community should give priority to combating terrorist forces on Syrian soil and strengthen its coordination of counterterrorism efforts. He said that "China is ready to work with the international community to urge for a political solution to the Syrian crisis as soon as possible."⁸¹

On 13 January 2017, a Chinese envoy called on the international community to support countries in Central and West Africa in their counter-terrorism efforts. He noted that the international

⁷⁵ India-Russia Discuss Defence Cooperation, Cross Border Terrorism in High Level Talks, The Times of India (New Delhi) 31 January 2017. Access Date: 1 February 2017.

⁷⁶ BRICS NSAs meet to discuss cooperation in counter-terrorism, Times of India 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/brics-nsas-meet-to-discuss-cooperation-in-counter-terrorism/articleshow/59801610.cms>

⁷⁷ China's Xi calls for more cooperation from BRICS amid standoff with India, Hindustan Times 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/china-s-xi-jinping-calls-for-more-cooperation-from-brics-nations-amid-standoff-with-india/story-1zmk5viCYSx2ZTljFKTZ4O.html>

⁷⁸ EU and China agree to cooperate on anti-terrorism agenda, China Daily (Beijing) 27 September 2016. Access Date: 15 January 2017. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/cn_eu/2016-09/27/content_26904380.htm

⁷⁹ China, India to enhance efforts against terrorism, China Daily (Beijing) 28 September 2016. Access Date: 15 January 2017. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/cndy/2016-09/28/content_26920079.htm

⁸⁰ Russian State Duma ratifies China-Russia anti-terrorism agreement, China Daily (Beijing) 11 November 2016. Access Date: 15 January 2017. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/cn_eu/2016-11/11/content_27353304.htm

⁸¹ Statement by Ambassador WU Haitao at the Security Council Briefing on Syria, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (New York) 13 December 2016. Access Date: 28 February.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjb_663304/zwjg_665342/zwbd_665378/t1429867.shtml

community should take an active role in assisting countries in the region to fight terrorism and to further eliminate the threat of terrorism in the region.⁸²

On 28 July 2017, BRICS National Security Advisers held their annual security dialogue in Beijing, China, hosted by China's State Councillor Yang Jiechi.⁸³ The national security advisers discussed BRICS cooperation in counter terrorism, including suggestions that the BRICS countries should "take the lead role in countering global terrorism and address also regional issues."⁸⁴

During the compliance period, actions were taken on the bilateral and international level.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Renata Ma

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment on terrorism.

On 3 November 2017, the Heads of State of South Africa and Zimbabwe condemned the upsurge of terrorism and extremism in some regions of the continent and called for enhanced cooperation by AU Member States and other stakeholders in combating the terrorism.⁸⁵

On 28 July 2017, BRICS National Security Advisers held their annual security dialogue in Beijing, China, hosted by China's State Councillor Yang Jiechi.⁸⁶ The national security advisers discussed BRICS cooperation in counter terrorism, including suggestions that the BRICS countries should "take the lead role in countering global terrorism and address also regional issues."⁸⁷

During the compliance period, actions were taken on the bilateral level and international level.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Saakshi Lunkad

⁸² Chinese envoy calls for support to counter-terrorism effort in West-Africa, China Daily (Beijing) 13 January 2017. Access Date: 15 January 2017. http://africa.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2017-01/13/content_27947041.htm

⁸³ BRICS NSAs meet to discuss cooperation in counter-terrorism, Times of India 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/brics-nsas-meet-to-discuss-cooperation-in-counter-terrorism/articleshow/59801610.cms>

⁸⁴ China's Xi calls for more cooperation from BRICS amid standoff with India, Hindustan Times 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/china-s-xi-jinping-calls-for-more-cooperation-from-brics-nations-amid-standoff-with-india/story-1zmk5vICYSx2ZTljFKTZ4O.html>

⁸⁵ "South Africa: International Relations On Inaugural Session of South Africa-Zimbabwe Bi-National Commission." AllAfrica. 3 November. 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2017.

⁸⁶ BRICS NSAs meet to discuss cooperation in counter-terrorism, Times of India 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/brics-nsas-meet-to-discuss-cooperation-in-counter-terrorism/articleshow/59801610.cms>

⁸⁷ China's Xi calls for more cooperation from BRICS amid standoff with India, Hindustan Times 28 July 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/china-s-xi-jinping-calls-for-more-cooperation-from-brics-nations-amid-standoff-with-india/story-1zmk5vICYSx2ZTljFKTZ4O.html>

4. Corruption: International Cooperation

2016-26: We support the strengthening of international cooperation against corruption, including through the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, as well as on matters related to asset recovery and persons sought for corruption.

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Total		+0.80	

Background

In June 2015, at the Ufa Summit, the BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment against corruption. This commitment was based on their acknowledgement that “corruption including illicit money and financial flows, and ill-gotten wealth stashed in foreign jurisdictions is a global challenge which may impact negatively on economic growth and sustainable development.”⁸⁸ The BRICS member countries also cited the United Nations Conventions Against Corruption (UNCAC) as the basis on which to act. The UNCAC is a global legally binding international anti-corruption convention. It is the core basis for the Anti-Corruption Plan as it includes a detailed list of standards, rules and measures that states are offered to use in order to fight corruption and also offers a mechanism of implementation.⁸⁹

At the 2015 Ufa BRICS Summit, the Anti-Corruption Working Group was created to combat corruption that will “work for the inclusion of crime prevention and criminal justice issues among the long-term priorities of the UN agenda.” During India’s 2016 presidency, BRICS Senior Members have met three times to discuss anti-corruption since the Working Group was established: March 16 in Paris, June 8 in London, and October 17 in Paris. No details are available on these meetings.⁹⁰

Commitment Features

Support for international corruption in anti-corruption, with reference to the UNCAC’s article on international cooperation, is defined as:

Where appropriate and consistent with their domestic legal system, States Parties shall consider assisting each other in investigations of and proceedings in civil and administrative matters relating to corruption.

In matters of international cooperation, whenever dual criminality is considered a requirement, it shall be deemed fulfilled irrespective of whether the laws of the requested State Party place the offence within the same category of offence or denominate the offence by the same terminology

⁸⁸ Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Center. Date of Access: 12 December 2016.

<http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁸⁹ United Nations Convention against Corruption, United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime (Vienna) 2004. Date of Access: 8 December 2016. https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/Publications/Convention/08-50026_E.pdf

⁹⁰ Calendar, BRICS: India 2016 (Goa) 2016. Date of Access: 8 December 2016.

<http://brics2016.gov.in/content/calender.php>

as the requesting State Party, if the conduct underlying the offence for which assistance is sought is a criminal offence under the laws of both States Parties.⁹¹

BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group Cooperation: A Working Group created during the Ufa BRICS Summit. At the Summit, BRICS Leaders expressed their conviction that corruption is a global challenge. Support can take the form of public declarations of support, financial support, institutional support, etc.

Support on matters related to asset recovery, with reference to the general measures on asset recovery in the UNCAC, entails that “each State Party shall take such measures as may be necessary, in accordance with its domestic law, to require financial institutions within its jurisdiction to verify the identity of customers, to take reasonable steps to determine the identity of beneficial owners of funds deposited into high-value accounts and to conduct enhanced scrutiny of accounts sought or maintained by or on behalf of individuals who are, or have been, entrusted with prominent public functions and their family members and close associates.” Specific measures can include any of the following:

- “Issu[ing] advisories regarding the types of natural or legal person to whose accounts financial institutions within its jurisdiction will be expected to apply enhanced scrutiny”
- “Notify[ing] financial institutions within its jurisdiction, at the request of another State Party or on its own initiative, of the identity of particular natural or legal persons to whose accounts such institutions will be expected to apply enhanced scrutiny;”
- “Implement[ing] measures to ensure that its financial institutions maintain adequate records ... of accounts and transactions involving the persons mentioned [above]”
- “Implement[ing] appropriate and effective measures to prevent, with the help of its regulatory and oversight bodies, the establishment of banks that have no physical presence and that are not affiliated with a regulated financial group.”⁹²

Support on matters related to Persons sought for corruption, with regard to the UNCAC’s article on extradition, is summarized by the treaty’s article on extradition and transfer of sentenced persons.

- Extradition refers to when “the person who is the subject of the request for extradition is present in the territory of the requested State Party, provided that the offence for which extradition is sought is punishable under the domestic law of both the requesting State Party and the requested State Party.”
- On transfer of sentenced persons state that “State Parties may consider entering into bilateral or multilateral agreements or arrangements on the transfer of their territory of persons sentenced to imprisonment or other forms of deprivation of liberty for offences established in accordance with this convention in order that they may complete their sentences there.”
- In addition, there are possible legal assistance measures that could be taken in support of the above articles, including “taking evidence or statements from persons; effecting service of judicial

⁹¹ UNCAC. UN Convention Against Corruption. Access Date: 12 December 2016.
https://www.unodc.org/documents/brussels/UN_Convention_Against_Corruption.pdf

⁹² UNCAC. UN Convention Against Corruption. Access Date: 12 December 2016.
https://www.unodc.org/documents/brussels/UN_Convention_Against_Corruption.pdf

documents; executing searches and seizures, and freezing; examining objects and sites; providing information, evidentiary sites and expert evaluations; providing originals or certified copies of relevant documents and records, including government, bank, financial, corporate or business records; identifying or tracing proceeds of crime, property, instrumentalities or other things for evidentiary purposes; [and] facilitating the voluntary appearance of persons in the requesting State Party;”⁹³

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member did not support any of the above aspects of international cooperation in anti-corruption.
0	Member supported more than one of the above aspects of international cooperation in anti-corruption, with reference to UNCAC guidelines.
+1	Member supported all of the aspects of international cooperation including supporting the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, support on matters related to asset recovery, AND support on matters related to persons sought for corruption.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment on corruption.

On 17 October 2016, Brazil attended the third meeting of BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption was held in Paris on the margins of the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group Meeting. The participants discussed the Russian proposal on illicit asset recovery.⁹⁴

On 17 November 2016, Brazilian police arrested former governor of Rio de Janeiro Sergio Cabral “as part of an investigation into alleged bribery and misuse of government money.”⁹⁵

On 25 November 2016, Culture Minister Marcelo Calero accused President Michel Temer of corruption by putting “pressure on him to sidestep a heritage preservation order that was holding up construction on a tower block in the north-eastern city of Salvador.”⁹⁶ The crisis forced the resignation of Geddel Vieira Lima, who was a close aide of the president and had purchased an apartment in the residence.⁹⁷

On 26 January 2017, Brazil’s federal police asked Interpol to carry out a preventative arrest warrant for Eike Batista, a former billionaire accused of money laundering and corruption.⁹⁸

⁹³ UNCAC. UN Convention Against Corruption. Access Date: 12 December 2016.

https://www.unodc.org/documents/brussels/UN_Convention_Against_Corruption.pdf

⁹⁴ BRICS Anti-Corruption Cooperation Meeting, Government of India 17 October 2016. Access Date: 12 December 2016. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/_anticorruption-paris.pdf

⁹⁵ Brazil Police Arrest Former Rio State Governor in Graft Investigation, Wall Street Journal (Sao Paulo) 17 November 2016. Access Date: 17 January 2017. <http://www.wsj.com/articles/brazil-police-arrest-former-rio-state-governor-in-graft-investigation-1479383324>.

⁹⁶ Fresh crisis in Brazil as new president faces corruption allegations, The Guardian (Rio de Janeiro) 25 November 2016. Access Date: 17 January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/nov/25/brazil-president-michel-temer-corruption-scandal-marcelo-calero>.

⁹⁷ Fresh crisis in Brazil as new president faces corruption allegations, The Guardian (Rio de Janeiro) 25 November 2016. Access Date: 17 January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/nov/25/brazil-president-michel-temer-corruption-scandal-marcelo-calero>.

⁹⁸ Brazil Taps Interpol in Hunt for Former Billionaire Batista, Bloomberg 26 January 2017. Access Date: 5 March 2017. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-01-26/former-billionaire-batista-sought-by-brazil-police-in-graft-case>.

On 23 March 2017, the director and general coordinator of the Department of Asset Recovery and International Legal Cooperation (DRCI) of the National Secretariat of Justice, Luiz Roberto Ungaretti and Isalino Giacomet Júnior, held a meeting with members of the French Central Authority for international legal cooperation in criminal matters. The meeting followed on from the Plenary Meeting of the Financial Action Task Force against Money Laundering and Terrorism Financing (FATF), held from 19 to 24 February in Paris.⁹⁹

On 19 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs met in Beijing China. The Ministers noted their concern with the “threats and challenges posed by the use of ICTs for criminal and terrorist purposes” and underscored “the role of collaborative efforts to address these challenges” and noted with satisfaction the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.¹⁰⁰

Brazil has supported the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group and matters related to persons sought for corruption and asset recovery.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Doris Li

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment on corruption.

On 17 October 2016, Russia attended the third meeting of BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption was held in Paris on the margins of the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group Meeting. The participants discussed the Russian proposal on illicit asset recovery.¹⁰¹

On 9 December 2016, the International Anti-Corruption Day, Russian Deputy Foreign Minister Oleg Syromolotov made the following statement: “The United Nations remains for us the priority anti-corruption platform. We are convinced that the work of other international and regional forums should complement and not substitute for the UN format, and should be based on the UN Convention against Corruption (UNCAC), which is a unique international legal instrument governing the whole complex of issues of international cooperation on this track. He also reported that Russia has conducted serious work on anti-corruption following the framework of the G20 group through the adoption of new High Level Principles on Cooperation on Persons Sought for Corruption and Asset Recovery as well as a new anti-corruption action plan for 2017-2018. In addition, he stated that anti-corruption cooperation between BRICS countries was also gaining momentum.¹⁰²

On 6 March 2017, Vasily Pozdyshev, Russia’s Deputy Central Bank Governor, mentioned that “Russia plans to extend a review of bank licenses for another two years, shutting down more banks

⁹⁹ Brasil e França discutem cooperação jurídica internacional em matéria penal, Ministry of Justice and Public Security of Brazil 23 March 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://www.justica.gov.br/noticias/em-paris-brasil-e-franca-discutem-cooperacao-juridica-internacional>

¹⁰⁰ Media Note of the Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC 19 June 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1471323.shtml

¹⁰¹ BRICS Anti-Corruption Cooperation Meeting, Government of India 17 October 2016. Access Date: 12 December 2016. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/_anticorruption-paris.pdf

¹⁰² Russia calls on international community to join efforts in fighting corruption, Sputnik News 9 December 2016. Access Date: 12 December 2016. <https://sputniknews.com/politics/201612091048351678-russia-corruption-fight/>

after closing hundreds in the past 5 years, mostly for committing fraud or other crimes.”He mentioned his team needs time until 2019 to finish the crackdown. He further mentioned, “We are up against a whole business of creating fictitious borrowers ... This is a whole virtual world managed by IT [information technology] programs and servers which very often aren’t located in the bank.”¹⁰³

On 19 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs met in Beijing China. The ministers noted their concern with the “threats and challenges posed by the use of ICTs [information and communications technologies] for criminal and terrorist purposes” and underscored “the role of collaborative efforts to address these challenges” and noted with satisfaction the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.¹⁰⁴

Russia has supported the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, matters related to asset recovery and persons sought for corruption.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Isra Batool

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment on corruption,

On 17 October 2016, India attended the third meeting of BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption was held in Paris on the margins of the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group Meeting. The participants discussed the Russian proposal on illicit asset recovery.¹⁰⁵

On 8 November 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi announced the demonetization of INR 500 and INR 2000 notes and that they will not be legal tender as of midnight on 9 November 2016.¹⁰⁶ This policy is meant to “weed out rampant corruption, black money, false currency, and in turn help tackle broader issues fueled by these activities, such as poverty and terrorism.”¹⁰⁷

On 1 February 2017, Finance Minister Arun Jaitley presented the Union Budget 2017-18 and stated that the government is taking steps to make people more tax compliant in an attempt to flush out black money and end corruption.¹⁰⁸

On 9 February 2017, Prime Minister Narendra Modi requested Britain to extradite Vijay Mallya, who was accused of money laundering, among other charges.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰³ Russia Pushes to Rid Itself of 'Potemkin' Banks by 2019, Reuters 6 March 2017. Access date: 6th March 2017. <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-russia-banks-idUSKBN16D0H2>

¹⁰⁴ Media Note of the Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC 19 June 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1471323.shtml

¹⁰⁵ BRICS Anti-Corruption Cooperation Meeting, Government of India 17 October 2016. Access Date: 12 December 2016. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/_anticorruption-paris.pdf

¹⁰⁶ Modi: India's Rs 500 and Rs 1,000 Notes No Longer Valid, The Diplomat (Tokyo) 10 November 2016. Access Date: 17 January 2017. <http://thediplomat.com/2016/11/modi-indias-rs-500-and-rs-1000-notes-no-longer-valid/>

¹⁰⁷ Modi: India's Rs 500 and Rs 1,000 Notes No Longer Valid, The Diplomat (Tokyo) 10 November 2016. Access Date: 17 January 2017. <http://thediplomat.com/2016/11/modi-indias-rs-500-and-rs-1000-notes-no-longer-valid/>

¹⁰⁸ Focus of the Union Budget was to fight corruption and black money, says Arun Jaitley, The Indian Express (New Delhi) 1 February 2017. Access Date: 5 March 2017. <http://indianexpress.com/article/business/economy/arun-jaitley-live-press-conference-union-budget-income-tax-finance-minister-income-tax/>

On 19 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs met in Beijing China. The ministers noted their concern with the “threats and challenges posed by the use of ICTs [information and communications technologies] for criminal and terrorist purposes” and underscored “the role of collaborative efforts to address these challenges” and noted with satisfaction the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.¹¹⁰

India has supported the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, matters on asset recovery and persons sought for corruption.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Doris Li

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment on corruption,

On 17 October 2016, China attended the third meeting of BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption was held in Paris on the margins of the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group Meeting. The participants discussed the Russian proposal on illicit asset recovery.¹¹¹

On 8th November 2016, Communist Party Central Committee announced the organization of a new anti-graft body which would include Ministry of Supervision, the National Bureau of Corruption Prevention, and the Anti-Corruption Bureau in response to fight corruption which would combine several state agencies and oversee all public servants.¹¹²

On 16th November, Chinese Central Commission for Central Inspection announced that Yang Xiuzhu, China’s most wanted economic fugitive, handed herself over to Chinese government as a result of the anti-corruption treaty between the United States and China.¹¹³

On 30th December 2016, People Bank of China in response to curb money laundering, will require financial institutions to report cross border transfers of RMB 200,000 (USD 28,800). In addition, regulators require banks to track individual transactions arising from cross-border transfers.¹¹⁴

On 31st December 2016, State Administration of Foreign Exchange increased the scrutiny of bank transactions and will require extra documentation for people seeking renminbi, keeping the annual constraint of USD 50,000 effective 1st January 2017.¹¹⁵

¹⁰⁹ India urges UK to extradite 16 including Vijay Mallya, The Economic Times (New Delhi) 23 February 2017. Access Date: 5 March 2017. <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/india-urges-uk-to-extradite-16-including-vijay-mallya/articleshow/57311987.cms>

¹¹⁰ Media Note of the Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC 19 June 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1471323.shtml

¹¹¹ BRICS Anti-Corruption Cooperation Meeting, Government of India 17 October 2016.

http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/_anticorruption-paris.pdf

¹¹² China To Set Up New Anti-Corruption Body to Oversee All Public Servants as it Intensifies Battle Against Graft, South China Morning Post, 8th November 2016. Access date: 4th March 2017. <http://www.scmp.com/news/china/policies-politics/article/2044014/china-set-new-anti-corruption-body-oversee-all-public>

¹¹³ China's most-wanted economic fugitive Yang Xiuzhu surrenders, BBC News 16 November 2016. Access date: 4th March 2017. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-china-37998796>

¹¹⁴ China Said to Boost Scrutiny of Foreign Currency Purchases, Bloomberg News, 31 December 2016. Access date: 5th March 2017. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-12-31/china-said-to-increase-scrutiny-of-foreign-currency-purchases-ixd3oijp>

On 7th March 2017, The Ministry of Public Security initiated a campaign “Fox Hunt” to capture suspected economic criminals. Ministry has also established the household registration system to investigate dual citizenship in a bid to crack down on corruption of “naked officials.”¹¹⁶

On 19 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs met in Beijing China. The ministers noted their concern with the “threats and challenges posed by the use of ICTs [information and communications technologies] for criminal and terrorist purposes” and underscored “the role of collaborative efforts to address these challenges” and noted with satisfaction the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.¹¹⁷

China has supported aspects of international cooperation in anti-corruption by supporting matters on asset recovery and persons sought for corruption and BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Isra Batool

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment on corruption.

On 17 October 2016, South Africa attended the third meeting of BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption was held in Paris on the margins of the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group Meeting. The participants discussed the Russian proposal on illicit asset recovery.¹¹⁸

On 9 December 2016, International Anti-Corruption Day, the South African government announced that it would commemorate International Anti-Corruption Day “under the national subtheme: ‘In a Partnership towards a National Anti-Corruption Strategy’.”¹¹⁹

On 19 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs met in Beijing. The ministers noted their concern with the “threats and challenges posed by the use of ICTs [information and communications technologies] for criminal and terrorist purposes” and underscored “the role of collaborative efforts to address these challenges” and noted with satisfaction the work of the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.¹²⁰

¹¹⁵China Said to Boost Scrutiny of Foreign Currency Purchases, Bloomberg News, 31 December 2016. Access date: 5th March 2017. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-12-31/china-said-to-increase-scrutiny-of-foreign-currency-purchases-ixd3oijp>

¹¹⁶China Ramps Up Overseas Hunt of Fugitive Officials, Mareeg 7th March 2017.. Access date: 8th March 2017. <https://mareeg.com/china-ramps-up-overseas-hunt-of-fugitive-officials/>

¹¹⁷Media Note of the Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC 19 June 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1471323.shtml

¹¹⁸ BRICS Anti-Corruption Cooperation Meeting, Government of India 17 October 2016. Access Date: 12 December 2016. http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/_anticorruption-paris.pdf

¹¹⁹ The country we would like to live in: A call for stronger anti-corruption actions in South Africa, UNODC 16 December 2016. Date of Access: 5 March 2017. https://www.unodc.org/southernafrica/en/stories/the-country-we-would-like-to-live-in_a-call-for-stronger-anti-corruption-actions-in-south-africa.html

¹²⁰Media Note of the Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the PRC 19 June 2017. Access Date 10 August 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1471323.shtml

South Africa has supported aspects of international cooperation in anti-corruption by supporting the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group and matters on asset recovery, but not persons sought for corruption.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Courtney Hallink

5. Health: Antimicrobial Resistance

2016-39: [We welcome the High Level meeting on Anti-Microbial Resistance (AMR) during UNGA-71, which addresses the serious threat that AMR poses to public health, growth and global economic stability.] We will seek to identify possibilities for cooperation among our health and/or regulatory authorities, with a view to share best practices and discuss challenges, as well as identifying potential areas for convergence.

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total		+0.40	

Background

Since its first summit in 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, the BRICS have made a total of nine commitments in the issue area of health. They have touched on issues such as HIV/AIDS, Ebola, and sexual and reproductive health as well as general commitments on international cooperation in the area on health. At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS made their first commitment on antimicrobial resistance (AMR).

AMR, according to the World Health Organization (WHO), refers to “when microorganisms (such as bacteria, fungi, viruses, and parasites) change when they are exposed to antimicrobial drugs (such as antibiotics, antifungals, antivirals, antimalarials, and anthelmintics).”¹²¹ Because of AMR, medicines could potentially become ineffective at combatting infections and thus the risk of spreading infections would increase as a result. AMR is a global concern because “new resistance mechanisms are emerging and spreading globally,” presenting difficulties to medical procedures, the treatment and prevention of infections, and increasing the cost of healthcare worldwide while also endangering the achievement of global human development.¹²²

On 21 September 2016, the United Nations held a High Level Meeting on AMR in New York. The meeting aimed to “summon and maintain strong national, regional and international political commitment in addressing antimicrobial resistance comprehensively and multi-sectorally, and to increase and improve awareness of antimicrobial resistance.”¹²³ The meeting recalled the World Health Assembly’s Resolution titled “Global Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance,” which set out five strategic objectives:

1. Improve awareness and understanding of antimicrobial resistance;
2. Strengthen surveillance and research;

¹²¹ “Antimicrobial resistance,” WHO September 2016. Access Date: 10 October 2016.
<http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs194/en/>

¹²² “Antimicrobial resistance,” WHO September 2016. Access Date: 10 October 2016.
<http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs194/en/>

¹²³ UN High-level meeting on antimicrobial resistance, UN General Assembly 21 September 2016.
<http://www.un.org/pga/71/event-latest/high-level-meeting-on-antimicrobial-resistance/>

3. Reduce the incidence of infection;
4. Optimize the use of antimicrobial medicines;
5. Ensure sustainable investment in countering antimicrobial resistance.¹²⁴

Commitment Features

This commitment mandates BRICS countries to address the issue of anti-microbial resistance under a collaborative framework. The commitment includes the following components: 1) identify possibilities and potential areas for cooperation or convergence, 2) share best practices to combat AMR, and 3) discuss the challenges of the issue.

The breakdown for this commitment is as follows:

The first part of the commitment requires BRICS member states to identify possibilities and potential areas for cooperation or convergence. Cooperation and convergence are defined as collaborative progress towards the goal of a unified response, which in the context of the commitment refers to the formulation of multilateral strategies to combat AMR. Such cooperation must occur with the involvement of health and/or regulatory authorities. These measures include, but are not limited to:

- High level meetings among BRICS countries and respective Ministries of Health
- Coordinated planning with international organizations and stakeholders
 - Including but not limited to the WHO, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), World Organization for Animal Health (OIE), etc.
- (Explicitly) Contributing to or under the framework of the UN General Assembly (UNGA) High Level Meeting on Anti-Microbial Resistance
- Developing partnerships with civil society organizations
- Contributing to the “One Health Approach”: holistic, multisectoral and interdisciplinary response

The second part of the commitment requires BRICS countries to “share best practices” in said issue area. Sharing best practices is defined as substantial contributions to the mutually beneficial exchange of information regarding reliable means proven to lead to desirable and successful results, all alternatives considered. Such practices can include technology, medical expertise, research methodology, policy instruments etc regarding following issue areas, sourced from the press release after the UNGA’s High Level Meeting on AMR, including but not limited to:¹²⁵

- Better use of existing programs to prevent infections
- Affordability of medical tools
- Investment into research and development of new medicine

¹²⁴ “World Health Assembly addresses antimicrobial resistance, immunization gaps and malnutrition,” WHO 25 May 2015. Access Date: 10 October 2016. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/releases/2015/wha-25-may-2015/en/>

¹²⁵ Press release: High-Level Meeting on Antimicrobial resistance, General Assembly of the United Nations 21 September 2016. Access Date: 10 October 2016. www.un.org/pga/71/2016/09/21/press-release-hl-meeting-on-antimicrobial-resistance/

The third part of the commitment requires BRICS member states to discuss challenges. This is defined as engaging in dialogue about the difficulties or obstacles within the issue area of AMR, including but not limited to do:

- Discussing market failures for the affordability of medicine
- Existing medical infrastructure surrounding appropriate use of existing antibiotics
- Acknowledging scientific and medical uncertainty within the field

The actions to which the BRICS member states have committed are threefold: 1) identify possibilities and potential areas of cooperation and convergence, 2) share best practices, and 3) discuss challenges in combating AMR.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Country did not identify possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, did not share best practices AND did not discuss challenges in combating AMR.
0	Country took actions in one or two of the following areas: identified possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, shared best practices or discussed challenges in combating AMR.
+1	Country identified possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, shared best practices AND discussed challenges in combating AMR.

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment on health.

In November 2016, Brazil hosted a conference for the first Latin America Point-of-Care Day. The conference aims to share best practices in many areas, including antimicrobial resistance.¹²⁶

On 29 March 2017, Health Minister Ricardo Barros met on Wednesday in Brasilia with representatives of Latin American countries, the European Union and international entities to discuss and promote the fight against antimicrobial resistance in the world. At the meeting, the action plans of the European and South American continents were addressed in the search for solutions to antimicrobial resistance, already seen as a global public health issue: the excessive and inappropriate use of antimicrobial drugs (antibiotics) has led to a increase the resistance of microorganisms to drugs.¹²⁷

On 29 March 2017, it was reported that, Brazil is preparing the National Action Plan for the Prevention and Control of Antimicrobial Resistance organized through an integrated dialogue between agencies such as Anvisa, Funasa and Ministries of Health, Agriculture, Science and Technology and the Environment . The Brazilian National Plan, which emphasizes the "Single Health" approach, reaffirms the guidelines of the Global Plan of Action on antimicrobial resistance and articulation between the World Health Organization (WHO), the Food and Agriculture

¹²⁶First Latin American Point-of-Care Conference, News Medical 27 march 2017. Access Date: 2 April 2017.

<http://www.news-medical.net/whitepaper/20170327/First-Latin-American-Point-of-Care-Conference.aspx>

¹²⁷ Brasil e União Europeia discutem ações para controlar resistência aos antibióticos, Health Portal brazil 29 March 2017. Access date: 28 August 20017. <http://portalsaude.saude.gov.br/index.php/o-ministerio/aisa/noticias-aisa/27935-brasil-e-uniao-europeia-discutem-aco-es-para-controlar-resistencia-aos-antibioticos>

Organization of the United Nations (FAO) And the World Organization for Animal Health (OIE) as focal points in the discussion of this topic.¹²⁸

Brazil shared best practices. However, it did not identify challenges or potential areas of international cooperation.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Katherine Svirsky

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment on health.

On 14 November, 2016, a roundtable discussion on antimicrobial resistance (AMR) was held in the Russian Federation. Various stakeholders were present at the round table, including policy makers, technical representatives of relevant ministries, academia, and international partners. A number of presenters and participants in the roundtable discussion participated and contributed to the process of development the national AMR work plan. Moreover, participants discussed the next steps for effective cooperation and collaboration among national and among international institutions.¹²⁹

Russia identified possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence. However, it did not discuss challenges or share best practices.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Katherine Svirsky

India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment on health.

On 9 November 2016, the Indian Department for Biotechnology announced a GBP13-million research project named Newton Bhabha in order to combat antimicrobial resistance (AMR). This project was publicized by Minister of State for Universities, Science, Research and Innovation of India.¹³⁰ This is a funding initiative jointly announced with the United Kingdom's Minister of Science Jo Johnson.¹³¹

On 9 November 2016 to 31 January 2017, the Indian government launched an online program named 'MyGov Innovation.' This is a database that facilitates the sharing and access of data relating

¹²⁸ Brasil e União Europeia discutem ações para controlar resistência aos antibióticos, Health Portal Brazil 29 March 2017. Access date: 28 August 2017. <http://portalsaude.saude.gov.br/index.php/o-ministerio/aisa/noticias-aisa/27935-brasil-e-uniao-europeia-discutem-acoes-para-controlar-resistencia-aos-antibioticos>

¹²⁹ Intersectoral round table on antimicrobial resistance, World Health Organization 18th November, 2016. Accessed on March 25th, <http://www.euro.who.int/en/countries/russian-federation/news/news/2016/12/intersectoral-round-table-on-antimicrobial-resistance>.

¹³⁰ New Partnership With India to Beat Antibiotic Resistance, Medical Research Council. 9 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <https://www.mrc.ac.uk/news/browse/new-partnership-with-india-to-beat-antibiotic-resistance/>

¹³¹ Government announces £80 million UK-India research fund, Chemistry World. 10 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <https://www.chemistryworld.com/news/government-announces-80-million-ukindia-research-fund-/1017667.article>

to AMR.¹³² This platform is an effort to surveil cases of AMR, and it is currently seeking a module for the import and export of data from the Antimicrobial Resistance Surveillance Network of the Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR).

On 1 December 2016, the ICMR and the Indian Council of Agricultural Research signed a memorandum of understanding (MOU) to cooperate in multiple areas of health, including antimicrobial resistance.¹³³ The Director-Generals of both state-funded research organizations expressed support for this cause.

On 8-9 December 2016, the Indian Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and National Centre for Disease Control hosted the National Workshop on Development of National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance in New Delhi.¹³⁴ This workshop was co-hosted by the World Health Organization Country Office of India.

On 16 December 2016, India's Minister of Health and Family Welfare Shri Jagat Prakash Nadda stated that the Indian government is aware of the current impact resulting from misuse of antibiotics.¹³⁵ This statement was given in response to a question from Lok Sabha, the lower house of India's bicameral parliament. This statement also outlined the government's actions in combating antimicrobial resistance in recent years.

On 16 January 2017, the Directorate of Food and Drugs Administration released a public notice, following a patient's death from AMR.¹³⁶ The notice advised the regulation of medical sales according to Schedule H and H1, and to take "stringent regulatory action" and "raise awareness" about the issue.

On 2 February 2017, the Directorate General of Health Service at the Central Drugs Standard Control Organization published a notice titled "Rational Use of Antibiotics for Limiting Antimicrobial Resistance."¹³⁷ The document outlines governmental efforts to curb the misuse of antibiotics.

On 22 February 2017, four Indian federal ministries launched a joint campaign to strategize against AMR. The Ministry of Agriculture, Animal Husbandry, Pharmaceuticals, and Environment will

¹³² Sharing and Access of Antimicrobial Resistance Data, Government of India. 9 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <https://innovate.mygov.in/challenges/sharing-and-access-of-antimicrobial-resistance-da/>

¹³³ ICMR, ICAR Sign MoU for Joint Research on Zoonoses, Anti-microbial Resistance, Nutrition, Pesticide Residues, Healthworld from the Economic Times. 2 December 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <http://health.economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/industry/icmr-icar-sign-mou-for-joint-research-on-zoonoses-anti-microbial-resistance-nutrition-pesticide-residues/55752432>

¹³⁴ National Workshop on Development of National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance, World Health Organization Country Office For India. Access Date: 21 February 2017. http://www.searo.who.int/india/mediacentre/events/2016/Action_plan_AMR/en/

¹³⁵ Lok Sabha Starred Question No. 437 To Be Answered on the 16th December 2016 Bacterial Infections, Government of India Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <http://164.100.47.190/loksabhaquestions/annex/10/AS437.pdf>

¹³⁶ Notice, Central Drug Standards Control Organization, Directorate General of Health Services, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (New Delhi) 16 January 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://www.dfda.goa.gov.in/attachments/article/295/Notice.PDF>

¹³⁷ Subject: Rational use of antibiotics for limiting anti-microbial resistance, Central Drug Standards Control Organization, Directorate General of Health Services (New Delhi) 2 February 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://www.dfda.goa.gov.in/images/Advisory.pdf>

coordinate on policies, and develop a MOU and action plan.¹³⁸

On 10-12 April 2017, the government of India participated in a workshop convened by the Food and Agriculture Organization to address antimicrobial use in aquaculture.¹³⁹ The event consisted of national delegates and fish health experts from China, Malaysia, Philippines, Vietnam, Ireland, the Netherlands, the US, the World Organization for Animal Health and more.

On 19 April 2017, the government of India published the finalized “National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance (NAP-AMR) 2017–2021,” following the conclusion of public consultation on the draft plan published on 22 February 2017. The report was coordinated by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare.¹⁴⁰ The action plan included a blueprint to contain AMR, and reaffirmed its support for the “One Health Approach.” Eleven government ministers also signed the Delhi Declaration, calling for civil society and international stakeholders to participate in the prevention and containment of AMR.

On 19 April 2017, the Minister of Health and Family Welfare J.P. Nadda hosted the Inter-Ministerial Consultation on AMR Containment.¹⁴¹ At the event, Nadda highlighted the necessity of inter-sector cooperation in surveilling and combating AMR.

On 29 June 2017, India’s Department of Biotechnology joined the European Joint Programming Initiative on Antimicrobial Resistance (JPIAMR), a global forum of 26 member states hosted by the European Union.¹⁴² This forum focuses on increasing coordinated global capacity to address AMR

On 17 July 2017, Dr. A.C. Dhariwal, the Director of India’s National Center for Disease Control visited the Embassy of the Netherlands to discuss the issue of AMR activity. This dialogue was held under the framework of the Indo Netherlands Collaboration on AMR Contamination.¹⁴³

India has identified possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, specifically within domestic regulatory authorities. India has also discussed challenges in combating AMR through the public statements of state officials. However, India did not share best practices.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Hou

¹³⁸Four ministries to come together to combat antimicrobial resistance, Hindustan Times (New Delhi) 15 February 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://www.hindustantimes.com/india-news/four-ministries-to-come-together-to-combat-antimicrobial-resistance/story-g9jX4SKWgLgl3mNo2rV7LK.html>

¹³⁹Reducing health risks from antimicrobial resistance, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (Mangalore) 11 April 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://www.fao.org/fishery/nems/40929/en>

¹⁴⁰National Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance, Government of India (New Delhi) April 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. http://cseindia.org/userfiles/inap_amr_20170420.pdf

¹⁴¹India to combat antimicrobial resistance, Prowellness India (New Delhi) 20 April 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://prowellnessindia.com/2017/04/20/india-to-combat-antimicrobial-resistance/>

¹⁴²The European Union is pleased to announce that the Department of Biotechnology, Government of India, joins the international initiative to tackle Antimicrobial Resistance, Delegation of the European Union to India and Bhutan (New Delhi) 12 July 2017. Access Date: 30 July 2017. https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/india_en/29717/The%20European%20Union%20is%20pleased%20to%20announc e%20that%20the%20Department%20of%20Biotechnology,%20Government%20of%20India,%20joins%20the%20intern ational%20initiative%20to%20tackle%20Antimicrobial%20Resistance

¹⁴³Photo Gallery, National Center for Disease Control (New Delhi). Access Date: 30 July 2017. <http://ncdc.gov.in/photo.asp?catid=32&id=photo>

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment on health.

On 31 October to 2 November 2016, a China-UK Joint Workshop on Antimicrobial Resistance in the Environment was hosted in Jiaxing, Zhejiang.¹⁴⁴ Its co-hosts included Jiaxing Municipal People's Government and the Institute of Urban Environment at the Chinese Academy of Sciences.

On 1 November 2016, the Chinese government banned colistin as a feed additive for animals.¹⁴⁵ Colistin is an antibiotic, and the mobile gene MCR-1 confers resistance. This policy prevents the spread of antimicrobial resistance (AMR), which stops bacteria from being transferred to other animals and humans.

On 15 November 2016, the Chinese government's National Health and Family Planning Commission launched an educational campaign at Peking University First Hospital in Beijing.¹⁴⁶ This was part of the World Health Organization's (WHO) World Antibiotic Awareness Week from the 14-20 November 2016, and held in collaboration with WHO's China office. The campaign aimed to increase public awareness about the risks of misuse of antibiotics. In addition, the Chinese government, the WHO, and the Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO) also produced an educational video about the causes of AMR and how ordinary citizens can contribute to the cause.¹⁴⁷

On 6 December 2016, China signed a memorandum of understanding (MOU) with the United Kingdom, establishing a new UK-China Antimicrobial Resistance Research and Innovation Collaboration.¹⁴⁸ The 2016 UK-China High Level People-to-People Dialogue took place in Shanghai, where the MOU was signed between United Kingdom's Secretary of State for Health and Chinese Science and Technology Minister. This MOU aims to establish a new Global AMR Innovation Fund between 2018 and 2020.

On 23 January 2017, the Food and Drug Administration of China released the "Code of Practice to Minimize and Contain Antimicrobial Resistance."¹⁴⁹ This document focused on the use of veterinary antimicrobial drugs, and provided a framework to ensure animal health.

On 15 February 2017, the Food and Drug Administration of China released a government report on AMR. The document was titled "Guidelines for Risk Analysis of Foodborne Microbial Resistance."¹⁵⁰

¹⁴⁴ China-UK scientists attend Joint Workshop on Antimicrobial Resistance in the Environment, Centre for Ecology and Hydrology Natural Environment Research Council (Jiaxing) 9 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <http://www.ceh.ac.uk/news-and-media/news/china-uk-scientists-attend-joint-workshop-antimicrobial-resistance-environment>

¹⁴⁵ Global Action on Antimicrobial Resistance, Medical Research Council. 17 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017 <http://www.insight.mrc.ac.uk/2016/11/17/global-action-amr/>

¹⁴⁶ China, Asian Neighbors Step Up Drive to Curb Overuse of Antibiotics as Resistance Fears Grow, Radio Free Asia. 18 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <http://www.rfa.org/english/news/china/china-asian-neighbors-step-up-drive-to-curb-overuse-of-antibiotics-as-resistance-fears-grow-11182016151814.html>

¹⁴⁷ China, Asian Neighbors Step Up Drive to Curb Overuse of Antibiotics as Resistance Fears Grow, Radio Free Asia. 18 November 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2017. <http://www.rfa.org/english/news/china/china-asian-neighbors-step-up-drive-to-curb-overuse-of-antibiotics-as-resistance-fears-grow-11182016151814.html>

¹⁴⁸ UK-China Ties Flourish at 2016 High Level People to People Dialogue, Gov.UK. 6 December 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-china-ties-flourish-at-2016-high-level-people-to-people-dialogue>

¹⁴⁹ Code of Practice to Minimize and Contain Antimicrobial Resistance, China Food and Drug Administration (Beijing) 23 January 2017. Access Date: 31 July 2017. <http://www.sda.gov.cn/WS01/CL1923/168959.html>

On 22 May 2017, at the 70th World Health Assembly, the government of China met with fellow BRICS government delegations and health ministers over a luncheon.¹⁵¹ The discussion focused on increasing cooperation in the health sector, the affordability of pharmaceutical products, and the prevention of tuberculosis.

On 7 July 2017, the BRICS health ministers met in Tianjin, hosted by the Chinese delegation. The member states released the Tianjin Communique, in which BRICS states agreed to strengthen cooperation and recognize the urgency of AMR, among other issues stated in paragraph 17.¹⁵²

On 17 July 2017, Ambassador Liu Jieyi from the Chinese Permanent Mission to the United Nations announced the launch of the Group of Friends on Antimicrobial Resistance. His remarks addressed the WHO Director-General and highlighted the importance of multilateral and inter-ministerial cooperation to combat AMR.¹⁵³

Overall, China has complied with its commitment to combat antimicrobial resistance. India complied to this commitment by identifying possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, specifically with international organizations such as the WHO and FAO. China has also discussed challenges in combating AMR through workshops jointly hosted with academic institutions. China shared best practice by discussing innovation at high level meetings with partners such as the UK.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Angela Hou

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment on health.

On 17-18 November 2016, the South African Department of Health and the United Kingdom Department of Health hosted a conference on antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in Johannesburg, South Africa.¹⁵⁴ The conference brought together countries in the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) in order to “discuss the challenges of AMR surveillance as well as the resources and regional collaborations available to support improvements in laboratory and surveillance capacity.”¹⁵⁵ The conference also included panel sessions and case studies in order to share best practices.

¹⁵⁰ Guidelines for Risk Analysis of Foodborne Antimicrobial Resistance, China Food and Drug Administration (Beijing) 15 February 2017. Access Date: 31 July 2017. <http://www.sda.gov.cn/WS01/CL1924/169551.html>

¹⁵¹ BRICS countries to strengthen health cooperation, National Health and Family Planning Commission of the PRC (Beijing) 25 May 2017. Access Date: 31 July 2017. http://en.nhfpc.gov.cn/2017-05/25/c_71700.htm

¹⁵² Tianjin Communique of BRICS Health Ministers Meeting, National Health and Family Planning Commission of the PRC (Beijing) 17 July 2017. Access Date: 31 July 2017. http://en.nhfpc.gov.cn/2017-07/17/c_71977.htm

¹⁵³ Remarks by Ambassador LIU Jieyi at the Reception to Launch the Group of Friends on Antimicrobial Resistance, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 17 July 2017. Access Date: 31 July 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjb_663304/zwjg_665342/zwbd_665378/t1478419.shtml

¹⁵⁴ “UK and South Africa host a regional conference on AMR Surveillance,” Government of the United Kingdom, Date of Access: 3 March 2017, <https://www.gov.uk/government/world-location-news/uk-and-south-africa-host-a-regional-conference-on-amr-surveillance>.

¹⁵⁵ “UK and South Africa host a regional conference on AMR Surveillance,” Government of the United Kingdom, Date of Access: 3 March 2017, <https://www.gov.uk/government/world-location-news/uk-and-south-africa-host-a-regional-conference-on-amr-surveillance>.

South Africa has identified possibilities and potential areas of cooperation or convergence, shared best practices, and discussed challenges in combating AMR.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Courtney Hallink

6. Macroeconomic Policy: Global Value Chains

“We agree to work for greater integration of MSMEs in Regional and Global Value Chains.”

8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total	+1.00		

Background

At the Ufa Summit the leaders concluded that “BRICS cooperation should be commensurate with the potential and make ample use of the capabilities of its Members and contribute to growth and sustainable development of their economies.”¹⁵⁶ Among the goals which BRICS countries have to pursue “creating conditions for the BRICS companies, in particular for micro-, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs), to be better integrated into the global value chains (GVSc) with higher added value” was mentioned.

At the Goa Summit, the BRICS leaders agreed that MSMEs provide major employment opportunities, at comparatively lower capital cost, and create self-employment opportunities in rural and underdeveloped areas. MSMEs thus help assure equitable wealth distribution nationally and globally. They commended the organization of the BRICS Second Roundtable on MSMEs by India with a focus on technical and business alliances in the MSMEs sector.¹⁵⁷

Commitment Features

This commitment focuses on the relatively new area of the BRICS economic agenda, providing for actions that would allow MSMEs to become more actively engaged in global value chains.

The term “value chain” refers to the full range of value-adding activities bringing a product or service through different stages of production. This includes design and development, input of raw materials and other factors, selection and assembly, physical transformation and processing, acquisition of required services such as transport and finance, and response to consumer demand.¹⁵⁸ The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) uses the term “global value chain” to describe “a sequence of the functional activities required in the process of value creation involving more than one country.”¹⁵⁹ According to their approach, “cross border production chains, which may comprise only two countries, a region or a global network, are commonly referred to as global value

¹⁵⁶ The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Center University of Toronto. Access date: 28 April 2017. en.brics2015.ru/load/381830

¹⁵⁷ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration Goa, India, October 16, 2016, BRICS Information Center University of Toronto. Access date: 4 April 2017. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

¹⁵⁸ Kaplinsky, R. and Morris, M. (2002). A Handbook for Value Chain Research.

¹⁵⁹ World Investment Report 2013, UNCTAD 2013. Access date: 3 May 2017. http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/wir2013_en.pdf

chains.”¹⁶⁰ UNCTAD thus does not differentiate between global and regional value chains (RVCs). Nor does the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, which claims that “while regional chains have captured significant interest by policy-makers in recent years, the empirical literature on the phenomenon remains scant; indeed, with few documented examples of regional chains, the precise definition of what constitutes regional chains remains ambiguous.”¹⁶¹ Although there is no strict definition of RVCs given by the specialized international organizations, it is still important to draw the line between GVCs and RVCs as BRICS is a global grouping consisting of regional powers which combine their efforts to facilitate not only their own growth but also the development of their respected regions. That is why the term RVC will be used to describe a sequence of the functional activities required in the process of value creation involving countries of the same macro-region. Some researchers also confine RVCs to a multi-country trade bloc (e.g., the North American Free Trade Agreement, the European Union, MERCOSUR, the Association of South East Asian Nations [ASEAN], the ASEAN Free Trade Area, etc.).¹⁶²

The commitment requires BRICS countries to implement policies aimed at helping MSMEs to participate in and take full advantage of regional and global value chains. Thus, in order to partially comply a member should implement policies aimed at fostering the inclusion of MSMEs in either RVCs or GVCs, whereas full compliance is registered for members that carry out policies that target both types of value chains. In particular, governments can establish programs to promote awareness and understanding of the benefits of MSMEs integration into regional and global value chains, work with multinational corporations to develop more specific capacity building programs for local MSMEs, including through the establishment of specialized institutions, develop policy tools providing incentives for and easing MSME involvement in regional and global value chains, sign agreements with countries of the same macro-region, and take actions within regional organizations they are members of aimed at MSMEs support.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member does not support greater integration of its micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) in regional and global value chains
0	Member supports integration of MSMEs in EITHER regional OR global value chains
+1	Member supports greater integration of MSMEs in BOTH regional AND global value chains

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on macroeconomic policy.

On 17 October 2016, Marcos Pereira, the Minister of Industry, Foreign Trade and Services, participated in the 34th Brazilian-German Economic Meeting in Weimar. Marcos Pereira noted the importance of bilateral partnership in several aspects, including the elaboration of Brazilian industry policy 4.0 as well as highlighted the importance of the Mercosur-European Union Agreement to

¹⁶⁰ Globalvalue Chains and Development, UNCTAD 2015. Access date: 3 May 2017.

http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/diae2013d1_en.pdf

¹⁶¹ Bamber, P. et al. (2014), “Connecting Local Producers in Developing Countries to Regional and Global Value Chains: Update”, OECD Trade Policy Papers, No. 160, OECD Publishing, Paris. Access date: 3 May 2017. <http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/docserver/download/5jzb95f18851-en.pdf?expires=1493808748&id=id&accname=guest&checksum=50164CED12FF2F9FAEB840A7DF3DC5AD>

¹⁶² Timothy J. Sturgeon How Do We Define Value Chains and Production Networks? Background Paper Prepared for the Bellagio Value Chains Workshop September 25 – October 1, 2000. Access date: 3 May 2017. <https://www.ids.ac.uk/ids/global/pdfs/vcdefine.pdf>

stimulate trade between Brazil and Germany. According to him, the German model of advanced manufacturing is one of the main references for Brazil. The minister also detailed the Brazilian proposal, which has five strategic areas: the technologies in question, the configuration of value chains, appropriate human resources training, regulatory frameworks and the necessary infrastructure.¹⁶³

On 8 March 2017, the Minister of Industry, Foreign Trade and Services, Marcos Pereira, announced that industries may be part of the program Rota Global which offers consulting with strategy design and monitoring for non-export companies to invest in the international market. This program which is signed by the Ministry of Industry, Foreign Trade and Services and the National Confederation of Industry will support the insertion of 500 Brazilian companies in the international market. The European Commission has already invested BRL 1.2 million in this program to boost productivity and competitiveness of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises in Latin America.¹⁶⁴

On 17 October 2016, Secretary of Special Secretariat for Micro and Small Enterprises José Ricardo Veiga presented the “National Pact for the Development of micro and small enterprises (MSEs),” which consists of joining forces of various federal, state and municipal bodies and entities, as well as partnerships with private institutions and universities so as to boost entrepreneurship in Brazil. First package of measures of the pact has three lines of action: Credit (around BRL 30 and BRL 40 billion were made available in credit lines exclusive to individual microentrepreneurs and micro and small entrepreneurs for use in working capital, investments and equipment purchase), training program for entrepreneurs (provide guidance in the area of business management), “Simple Exportation” project (reduce bureaucracy and simplify the international trade operation of MSEs as well as establish the figure of the logistics operator who will be responsible for all operational procedures of the export).¹⁶⁵

On 13 December 2016, the National Bank for Economic and Social Development (BNDES) announced a set of measures to simplify, streamline and expand access to credit for micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs). According to the institution, the plan aims to induce the recovery of economic growth, the maintenance and creation of jobs and increase in income. The expected impact is a 20% (BRL5.4 billion) increase in disbursements for the segment of small and medium-sized enterprises. In order to facilitate the acquisition of items necessary for the productive activities of MSMEs, the bank will increase the maximum limit of the BNDES Card from BRL 1 million to BRL 2 million from January 2017. Among the actions that are expected to be implemented in the first quarter of 2017, BNDES will increase from BRL 90 million to BRL 300 million the limit for MSMEs, which will provide about 1,500 new companies with financing.¹⁶⁶ Additionally, on 5 January 2017, Banco do Brasil also opened a credit line to finance taxes, buying raw materials for

¹⁶³Ministro Marcos Pereira participa de encontro econômico na Alemanha, Portal Brasil 18 October 2016. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/10/ministro-marcos-pereira-participa-de-encontro-economico-na-alemanha>

¹⁶⁴Parceria vai incentivar exportações de empresas brasileiras, Portal Brasil 8 March 2017. Access date: 12 March 2017. <http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2017/03/parceria-vai-incentivar-exportacoes-de-empresas-brasileiras>

¹⁶⁵Secretaria lança pacote de benefícios para os micro e pequenos negócios, Secretaria Especial da Micro e Pequena Empresa 17 October 2016. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://www.smpe.gov.br/noticias/secretaria-lanca-pacote-de-beneficios-para-os-micro-e-pequenos-negocios>

¹⁶⁶BNDES vai simplificar e ampliar crédito para micro e pequenas empresas, EBC Agência Brasil 13 December 2016. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/economia/noticia/2016-12/bndes-vai-simplificar-e-ampliar-credito-para-micro-e-pequenas-empresas>

MSEs. The payment term can reach 24 months, including up to a 90-day grace period to pay the first installment, with around 2.42% interest rate per month.¹⁶⁷

On 28 December 2016, on the official website Portal Brasil, a list of measures taken by the government to support the economy was published and one of these measures is the program “Brasil Mais Produtiva.” This program offers technological consulting services in the productive process aimed at increasing the productivity of 3,000 small and medium-sized industrial companies by at least 20% in the field of application of lean manufacturing tools. The concept is based on reducing the seven types of losses (overproduction, waiting time, transportation, overprocessing, inventory, movement and defects). The program is an accomplishment of the Ministry of Industry, Foreign Trade and Services, National Service of Industrial Apprenticeship, Brazilian Agency for the Promotion of Exports and Investments (APEX-Brazil), Brazilian Industrial Development Agency (SEBRAE) and BNDES.¹⁶⁸

On 18 January 2017, the federal government announced allocation of BRL 8.2 billion for financing for small and micro enterprises for the next two years from March under the program “More Simply Undertake: Less Bureaucracy, More Credit.” The money will be available in form of soft loans from Banco do Brasil and BNDES (O Banco Nacional de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social). This program also foresees the investment of BRL 200 million in the improvement of ten computerized systems to aid in debureaucratization and business management. The measures are promoted by Sebrae and Banco do Brasil together with the federal government. They aim to reduce the bureaucracy faced by entrepreneurs and guide them in seeking funds to expand the business. According to Sebrae (Serviço Brasileiro de Apoio às Micro e Pequenas Empresas), small and micro enterprises account of 98.5% of all Brazilian companies and they are responsible for 27% of gross domestic product and 41% of the wage bill.¹⁶⁹

Brazil has taken actions to support greater integration of its firms in regional and global value chains, including actions aimed specifically on MSMEs. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sofia Streltsova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on macroeconomic policy.

On 7 November 2016, heads of governments of Russia and China spoke in one voice on promoting international cooperation of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) during meeting with press. Protocol of understanding between two countries had been signed before the press-conference. Russian prime-minister Dmitry Medvedev and Premier Li Keqiang agreed that both countries should take joint actions to facilitate cooperation of enterprises of various sizes. Deepening cooperation

¹⁶⁷ Governo abre linha de crédito a micro e pequenas empresas, Portal Brasil 5 January 2017. Access date: 28 February 2017 <http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2017/01/governo-abre-linha-de-credito-a-micro-e-pequenas-empresas>

¹⁶⁸ País avança para a retomada do crescimento, Portal Brasil 28 December 2016. Access date: 28 February 2017 <http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/12/pais-avanca-para-a-retomada-do-crescimento>

¹⁶⁹ Governo anuncia R\$ 8,2 bilhões de crédito para pequenas e microempresas, Globo Organization 18 January 2017. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://g1.globo.com/politica/noticia/governo-anuncia-r-82-bilhoes-em-financiamentos-para-pequenas-e-microempresas.ghtml>

between businesses of two countries could transform into new point of international agenda, said the high officials.¹⁷⁰

On 8-9 December 2016, the IV International Conference «Foreign economic activities as the factor for efficient development of small and medium enterprises in the Russian Federation regions» took place in Omsk. The conference was organized by the Ministry of Economic Development of Russia. The conference was devoted to development of foreign activities of SMEs and support of the enterprises' competitiveness on foreign markets.¹⁷¹

On 21 December 2016, two government-led agencies, Russia's Federal Agency for Technical Regulation and Metrology (Rosstandart) and Russian Small and Medium Business Corporation (RSMB Corporation), signed an agreement aimed at comprehensive support for national SMEs. The agreement covers various matters including joint efforts on information provision. The document lays down a foundation of long-term strategic cooperation focused on facilitation of SME activity.¹⁷²

Russia has made progress towards supporting its national enterprises. Actions taken during the assessment period could greatly contribute to facilitating participation of MSMEs on regional and international areas. Actions were taken in many spheres from supporting information exchanges to implementing special taxation regime.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on macroeconomic policy.

On 18 October 2016, India has launched the National SC/ST (Schedule Castes/Schedule Tribes) Hub and ZED (Zero Defect, Zero Effect) Scheme to endow the most effective national enterprises with business opportunities. Both initiatives are the essential components of Make in India program launched by the government to promote national business, especially micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).¹⁷³

On 19 December 2016, the government launched an initiative allowing small enterprises to cut on taxes if they accept payments through electronic banking. This step is aimed at facilitating less-cash economic plan of the government.¹⁷⁴

On 17 March 2017, the Ministry of MSMEs of India has announced the launch of a program aimed at increasing of competitiveness of national enterprises. The program includes the process of upgrading of the network of Technology centers that are to provide local businesses with proper

¹⁷⁰ China, Russia to promote SME cooperation. Access date: 9 March 2017.

http://english.gov.cn/premier/news/2016/11/09/content_281475486878807.htm

¹⁷¹ The IV International Conference «Foreign Economic Activities As Factor For Efficient Development Of Small And Medium Enterprises In The Russian Regions». Access date: 9 March 2017. <http://www.siora.ru/iv-international-conference>

¹⁷² Rosstandart, RSMB sign agreement on interaction. Access date: 9 March 2017.

<http://www.akm.ru/eng/news/2016/december/21/ns5683764.htm>

¹⁷³ PM launches National SC/ST hub and Zero Defect, Zero Effect scheme. Access date: 4 April 2017.

<http://currentaffairs.gktoday.in/tags/zed-scheme>

¹⁷⁴ Less taxes for small traders on digital transactions: Govt. Access date: 4 April 2017.

<http://www.deccanherald.com/content/587383/less-tax-small-traders-digital.html>

access to technologies and information throughout the country. The program is funded both by the Government of India and the World Bank.¹⁷⁵

India implemented policies aimed at increasing competitiveness of its national MSMEs that facilitates their greater integration into regional and global value chains. Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on macroeconomic policy.

On 24 November 2016, Bank of China, Ltd. (BOC), supported by the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI), the Philippine Chamber of Commerce and Industry (PCCI) and the International Chamber of Commerce, Phil. (ICCP), hosted a roadshow to pave the way for the BOC Global SME Cross-Border Trade and Investment Conferences that will be held in the Philippines in 2017. Small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) are an important force for economic and social development. However, SMEs access to capital resources, markets and technology is limited. BOC finances SMEs directly and indirectly, while the “BOC Global SME Cross-border Matchmaking Service” aims to promote the interconnection between SMEs worldwide, helps them form the global value chain, and stimulates the globalization and vitality of SMEs. A Strategic Cooperation Agreement was also signed by BOC, ICCP, PCCI and DTI to jointly organize the “2017 BOC Global SME Cross-Border Trade and Investment Conferences” in the Philippines. During those conferences local SMEs will have an opportunity to conduct meetings with SMEs from overseas and through six rounds of one-to-one negotiations discuss opportunities in trade, technology import and acquisition.¹⁷⁶

On 14 February 2017, the Bank of China, a state-managed organization with headquarters in Beijing, presented its cross-border intermediary services program molded for SMEs (small and medium enterprises) from China and Thailand — a platform, which allows such companies to look for new commodity and technology markets as well as for new collaboration partners. As Wang Jian, general manager of SME Department, stated in May, 2017 Bank of China plans to organize a trip for over 100 companies from about 10 Chinese cities and provinces in order for them to be able to hold direct talks with the management of local SMEs. At the same time, companies from Thailand will be offered to participate in such talks in China.¹⁷⁷

China has taken actions aimed at supporting greater integration of its micro, small and medium-sized enterprises in regional and global value chains. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Kirill Gribkov

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment on macroeconomic policy.

¹⁷⁵ DC-MSME in process of upgrading and expanding the network of Technology Centers. Access date: 4 April 2017. <http://knnindia.co.in/news/newsdetails/msme/dc-msme-in-process-of-upgrading-and-expanding-the-network-of-technology-centres>

¹⁷⁶ Bank of China sets roadshow on SME Cross-Border Trade and Investment confabs, Manila Bulletin 25 November 2016. Access date: 1 March 2017 <https://www.pressreader.com/philippines/manila-bulletin/20161123/282003262021632>

¹⁷⁷ Bank of China offered small and medium-sized enterprises from Thailand a cross-border intermediary services program, Xinhua News Agency – Russia 15 February 2017. Access date: 1 March 2017 http://russian.news.cn/2017-02/15/c_136056856.htm

On 8 February 2017, South African President Jacob Zuma delivered the State of the National Address. According to him, the government is “accelerating the integration agenda through the implementation of SADC (South African Development Commission) — COMESA (Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa) — East African Community Free Trade Area.”¹⁷⁸ In addition, he mentioned free trade agreements (FTAs) with Mercosur, European Union and People’s Republic of China. As the Minister of Trade and Industry Rob Davis explained in the speech given on 15 February 2017, the objective of these FTAs is to promote trade on the African continent and foster the development of regional and global value chains.¹⁷⁹

On 16 February 2017, the Department of Small Business Development and the Department of Public Enterprises signed a memorandum of understanding, according to which state-owned companies of South Africa will delegate a significant part of their work to micro-, small and medium-sized enterprises.¹⁸⁰

South Africa has made efforts aimed at integration of MSME in Regional and Global Value Chains. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Ildar Khalilyulin

¹⁷⁸ State of the Nation Address 2017: full speech, Brand South Africa, 10 February 2017. Access date: 28 February 2017. <https://www.brandsouthafrica.com/governance/state-nation-address-2017-full-speech>

¹⁷⁹ Minister Rob Davies: Debate of the State of the Nation Address, South African Government, 15 February 2017. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://www.gov.za/speeches/sona-debate-minister-trade-and-industry-15-feb-2017-0000>

¹⁸⁰ SMMEs to get more business from SOEs, South African Government News Agency, 16 February 2017. Access date: 28 February 2017. <http://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/smmes-get-more-business-soes>

7. Tax: Automatic Exchange of Information

“We reaffirm our commitment to support international cooperation in this regard [in accordance with the principle that profit should be taxed in the jurisdiction where the economic activity is performed and the value is created], including in the Common Reporting Standard for Automatic Exchange of Tax Information (AEOI).”

8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Total	+1.00		

Background

The first time that BRICS countries committed to “enhance cooperation in the international forums targeting tax base erosion and information exchange for tax purposes” was in their 2014 Fortaleza Declaration.¹⁸¹ At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the leaders reaffirmed their intention to address tax issues and made commitments on tackling base erosion, assisting developing countries to strengthen tax administration capacity, and ensuring tax transparency and exchange of information for taxation purposes.¹⁸² Commitments on similar priorities in the international tax agenda were made at the Goa summit.¹⁸³

Commitment Features

This commitment requires BRICS members to support international tax cooperation to address base erosion and profit shifting.

According to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), its members, along with other countries, including BRICS countries, are establishing a modern international tax framework under which profits are taxed where economic activity and value creation occur. Work will be carried out to support all countries interested in implementing and applying the rules in a consistent and coherent manner, particularly those for which capacity building is an important issue.¹⁸⁴ Thus, to comply with this commitment BRICS countries are expected to participate in the BEPS Project, either by implementing OECD recommendations on base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS) embodied in 15 actions, or taking measures to support developing countries interested in applying anti-BEPS rules. BEPS actions focus on the following issues:

¹⁸¹ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre 15 July 2014. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.htm>

¹⁸² VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre 9 July 2015. Access date: 22 November 2016. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

¹⁸³ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

¹⁸⁴ The BEPS Package. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/beps-about.htm#BEPSPackage>

- Action 1 addresses the tax challenges of the digital economy and identifies the main difficulties that the digital economy poses for the application of existing international tax rules.
- Action 2 develops model treaty provisions and recommendations regarding the design of domestic rules to neutralize the effects of hybrid instruments and entities (e.g., double non-taxation, double deduction, long-term deferral).
- Action 3 sets out recommendations to strengthen the rules for the taxation of controlled foreign corporations (CFC).
- Action 4 outlines a common approach based on best practices for preventing base erosion through the use of interest expense, for example through the use of related-party and third-party debt to achieve excessive interest deductions or to finance the production of exempt or deferred income.
- Action 5 revamps the work on harmful tax practices with a focus on improving transparency, including compulsory spontaneous exchange on rulings related to preferential regimes, and on requiring substantial activity for preferential regimes, such as intellectual property regimes.
- Action 6 develops model treaty provisions and recommendations regarding the design of domestic rules to prevent treaty abuse.
- Action 7 contains changes to the definition of permanent establishment to prevent its artificial circumvention, e.g., via the use of commissionaire structures and the likes.
- Actions 8-10 contain transfer pricing guidance to assure that transfer pricing outcomes are in line with value creation in relation to intangibles, including hard-to-value ones, to risks and capital, and to other high-risk transactions.
- Action 11 establishes methodologies to collect and analyse data on BEPS and the actions to address it, develops recommendations regarding indicators of the scale and economic impact of BEPS and ensure that tools are available to monitor and evaluates the effectiveness and economic impact of the actions taken to address BEPS on an ongoing basis.
- Action 12 contains recommendations regarding the design of mandatory disclosure rules for aggressive tax planning schemes, taking into consideration the administrative costs for tax administrations and business and drawing on experiences of the increasing number of countries that have such rules.
- Action 13 contains revised guidance on transfer pricing documentation, including the template for country-by-country reporting, to enhance transparency while taking into consideration compliance costs.
- Action 14 develops solutions to address obstacles that prevent countries from solving treaty-related disputes under the Mutual Assessment Program, via a minimum standard in this area as well as a number of best practices. It also includes arbitration as an option for willing countries.
- Action 15 provides an analysis of the legal issues related to the development of a multilateral instrument to enable countries to streamline the implementation of the BEPS treaty measures, as

well as the mandate to carry out that work in 2016. Thus, no actions at national level are expected from G20 members in this particular area.¹⁸⁵

Measures to support developing countries interested in applying anti-BEPS rules may include: membership in the Inclusive Framework on BEPS; organizing different events on BEPS issues, for instance regional meetings and seminars, and public consultations; implementing programs aimed at capacity-building and exchange of experience.^{186,187}

In addition, this commitment emphasizes the implementation of the Common Reporting Standard (CRS) for the automatic exchange of tax information (AEOI). The CRS, approved by the OECD Council on 15 July 2014, calls on jurisdictions to obtain information from their financial institutions and automatically exchange that information with other jurisdictions on an annual basis. It sets out the financial account information to be exchanged, the financial institutions required to report, the different types of accounts and taxpayers covered, as well as common due diligence procedures to be followed by financial institutions.¹⁸⁸ The standard consists of the following four key parts: a model Competent Authority Agreement (CAA), providing the international legal framework for the automatic exchange of CRS information; the Common Reporting Standard; the commentaries on the CAA and the CRS; and the CRS Extensible Markup Language (XML) Schema User Guide.¹⁸⁹ The details of which jurisdictions will bilaterally exchange financial account information as required under the OECD's Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the CRS include those under the framework of Article 6 of the Multilateral Convention and the CRS MCAA, as well as exchange relationships based on bilateral agreements and the EU framework.¹⁹⁰ Bilateral exchange relationships that are currently in place for the automatic exchange of CRS information are presented on the OECD official site.¹⁹¹ All BRICS members have committed to implementing the AEOI standard by 2017 or 2018.¹⁹² Thus, concrete measures aimed at providing automatic exchange of information on tax issues are needed from BRICS countries for full compliance.

BRICS countries that have participated in the BEPS Project, either by implementing OECD recommendations on BEPS embodied in 15 BEPS Actions, or by taking measures to support developing countries interested in applying anti-BEPS, are considered to be partially compliant. Given the particular emphasis on the Common Reporting Standard for AEOI, full compliance additionally requires measures aimed at providing automatic exchange of tax information.

¹⁸⁵ BEPS Actions. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/beps-actions.htm>

¹⁸⁶ BEPS Inclusive Framework Composition. 31 October 2016. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/inclusive-framework-on-beps-composition.pdf>

¹⁸⁷ Background Brief: Inclusive Framework for BEPS Implementation. March 2016. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/background-brief-inclusive-framework-for-beps-implementation.pdf>

¹⁸⁸ Common Reporting Standard (CRS). Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/automatic-exchange/common-reporting-standard/>

¹⁸⁹ Common Reporting Standard (CRS). Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/automatic-exchange/common-reporting-standard/>

¹⁹⁰ International framework for the CRS. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/automatic-exchange/international-framework-for-the-crs/#d.en.370900>

¹⁹¹ Activated exchange relationships for CRS information. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/automatic-exchange/international-framework-for-the-crs/exchange-relationships/#d.en.345426>

¹⁹² AEOI: status of commitments. Access date: 22 November 2016. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/transparency/AEOI-commitments.pdf>

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member NEITHER takes actions to support international tax cooperation to address base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS) NOR makes progress in providing automatic exchange of information (AEOI) with other jurisdictions.
0	Member takes actions aimed at supporting international tax cooperation to address BEPS BUT fails to make any progress in providing AEOI with other jurisdictions.
+1	Member takes actions aimed at supporting international tax cooperation to address BEPS AND makes progress in providing AEOI with other jurisdictions.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on taxes.

On 21 October 2016, as part of the ongoing efforts to increase transparency in cross-border developments, Brazil, signed a Multilateral Agreement of Competent Authorities for the Common Reporting Standard (CRS). This agreement is supported by the Convention on Mutual Assistance in Tax Matters and reinforces the commitment on the implementation of the global standard for the automatic exchange of financial information for tax purposes. It is a significant advance in the implementing actions on base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS) and in international tax cooperation.¹⁹³

On 21 October 2016, Brazil signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement for the automatic exchange of country-by-country (CbC) reports. It includes an annual report through which multinational groups should provide the tax administration of the jurisdiction of residence of their final controller with various information and indicators related to the location of activities, global allocation of income and taxes paid.¹⁹⁴

On 4 November 2016, the Federal Revenue Service of Brazil announced the adoption of CbC reporting, a new standard of documentation on global operations to be required from multinational groups by tax administrations.¹⁹⁵

Brazil has made progress in implementing domestic reforms consistent with the BEPS package and made progress in providing automatic exchange of tax information with other jurisdictions. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sofia Streltsova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on taxes.

¹⁹³Acordo Multilateral entre Autoridades Competentes sobre o Intercâmbio Automático de Informações Financeiras (MCAA - CRS), Secretaria da Receita Federal do Brasil 15 November 2016. Access date: 20 December 2016. <http://idg.receita.fazenda.gov.br/aceso-rapido/legislacao/acordos-internacionais/acordos-para-intercambio-de-informacoes-relativas-a-tributos/convencao-multilateral-sobre-assistencia-mutua-administrativa-em-materia-tributaria/acordo-multilateral-entre-autoridades-competentes-sobre-o-intercambio-automatizado-de-informacoes-financeiras-mcaa-crs>.

¹⁹⁴The Latest on BEPS – 24 October 2016, E&Y 24 October 2016. Access date: 12 January 2017. <http://taxinsights.ey.com/archive/archive-news/the-latest-on-beps-24-october-2016.aspx>.

¹⁹⁵Consulta Publica RFB Nº 11/2016, Secretaria da Receita Federal do Brasil 4 November 2016. Access date: 20 December 2016. <http://idg.receita.fazenda.gov.br/sobre/consultas-publicas-e-editoriais/consulta-publica/arquivos-e-imagens/consulta-publica-rfb-no-11-2016.pdf>.

On 12 December 2016, the Government of Russia decided to sign the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement on the Exchange of Country-by-Country Reports.¹⁹⁶

On 1 January 2017, the Agreement between Russia and China on Avoidance of Double Taxation entered into force.¹⁹⁷

According to the Section 11 of the Main Directions for Tax Policy in 2017 and 2018-2019 Period, published by the Russian Ministry of Finance on 30 November 2016, Russia will continue to conclude new agreements on avoidance of double taxation with other countries.¹⁹⁸

Russia is a signatory of the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement on Automatic Exchange of Financial Account Information and intends to implement first information exchange in September 2018.¹⁹⁹

Russia has made progress in implementing domestic reforms consistent with the BEPS Package and made progress in providing automatic exchange of tax information with other jurisdictions. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on taxes.

According to Deloitte, to address base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS) India has made progress in implementation of BEPS Actions 1, 5, 6 and 13.²⁰⁰

India first introduced the General Anti-Avoidance Rules in the domestic tax law in 2012, but the same has been deferred to become active from April 2017.²⁰¹

On 29 February 2016, the Indian government introduced an equalization levy on online advertising revenue earned from India by non-resident e-commerce companies, which became effective on 1 June 2016.²⁰²

¹⁹⁶ Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement on the Exchange of Country-By-Country Reports, Government of Russia 12 December 2016. <http://government.ru/docs/25626/>

¹⁹⁷ List of International Agreements on Avoiding Double Taxation between Russia and Other Countries, Ministry of Finance of Russia 30 December 2016.

http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/tax_relations/international/?id_57=117045&page_id=179&popup=Y&area_id=57

¹⁹⁸ Main Directions for Tax Policy in 2017 and 2018-2019 Period, Ministry of Finance.

http://minfin.ru/ru/?id_65=116206&page_id=1&popup=Y&area_id=65

¹⁹⁹ Signatories of the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement on Automatic Exchange of Financial Account Information and Intended First Information Exchange Date, OECD 2 November 2016.

<http://www.oecd.org/tax/automatic-exchange/international-framework-for-the-crs/MCAA-Signatories.pdf>

²⁰⁰ BEPS Actions implementation by India, Deloitte September 2016. Access date: 16 December 2016.

<https://www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/global/Documents/Tax/dttl-tax-beps-actions-implementation-india.pdf>

²⁰¹ Final Report on General Anti Avoidance Rules (GAAR) in Income-tax Act, 1961, Ministry of Finance of the Republic of India 02 September 2012. Access date: 27 December 2016.

http://www.finmin.nic.in/reports/report_gaar_itact1961.pdf

²⁰² India introduces new equalization levy on online advertising revenue, PWC 06.06.2016. Access date: 27 December 2016. <http://www.pwc.com/us/en/tax-services/publications/insights/assets/pwc-india-introduces-new-equalization-levy-on-online-advertising-revenue.pdf>

On 14 May 2016, the Indian Finance Act 2016 introduced the country-by-country reporting requirement in the Indian regulations.²⁰³

India has made progress in implementing domestic reforms consistent with the BEPS package and made progress in providing automatic exchange of tax information with other jurisdictions. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Evgeny Tsarik

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on taxes.

On 10 September 2016, the State Administration of Taxation (SAT) issued the Administrative Measures on Tax Payment Credit, provided taxation convenience for selected taxpayers with Class A credit standing, and established the “black list.”²⁰⁴

On 1 January 2017, the Agreement between Russia and China on Avoidance of Double Taxation entered into force.²⁰⁵

On 29 June 2016, SAT issued a new regulation (Bulletin 42) to replace the rules in Circular 2, through which the transfer pricing guidelines of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development are implemented in China) to the extent they relate to transfer pricing compliance (disclosure and documentation). It also includes a form for country-by-country (CbC) reporting, which complies with Action 13 on base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS) and lays the foundation for the future exchange of CbC information.²⁰⁶

China has made progress in implementing domestic reforms consistent with the BEPS package and made progress in providing automatic exchange of tax information with other jurisdictions. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Kirill Krivosheyev

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment on taxes.

On 1 October 2016, the Special Voluntary Disclosure Programme was launched in South Africa. It was created for individuals and companies who have not in the past disclosed tax and exchange control defaults in relation to offshore assets.²⁰⁷

²⁰³ The finance act, 2016, Ministry of law and justice of the Republic of India 14.05.2016 Access date: 18 December 2016. <http://taxindiaupdates.in/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/Finance-Act-2016-No.-28-of-2016.pdf>.

²⁰⁴ Taxation Honesty Promotes Construction of "Credit China", State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China 07 November 2016. Access date: 08 January 2017. <http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2342441/content.html>.

²⁰⁵ List of International Agreements on Avoiding Double Taxation between Russia and Other Countries, Ministry of Finance of Russia 30 December 2016. http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/tax_relations/international/?id_57=117045&page_id=179&popup=Y&area_id=57

²⁰⁶ BEPS Country Scorecards on Base Erosion and Profit Shifting, Deloitte | Audit, Consulting, Financial, Risk Management, Tax Services 31.08.2016. Access date: 08 January 2017. <https://www2.deloitte.com/global/en/pages/tax/articles/beps-country-scorecards.html>.

²⁰⁷ Voluntary Disclosure Programme (VDP), South African revenue Service. Access date: 12 January 2017. <http://www.sars.gov.za/Legal/VDP/Pages/default.aspx>.

On 28 October 2016, the South Africa Revenue Service adopted additional transfer pricing documentation requirements, under Section 29 of the Tax Administration Act, for South African companies with cross-border related-party transactions that exceed ZAR 100 million each year in aggregate.²⁰⁸

On 24 November 2016, South Africa and Switzerland have signed an agreement on automatic exchange of information in tax matters. The parties will start the exchange process in 2018 on reciprocal basis.²⁰⁹

On 4 May 2017, South Africa has activated the process of automatic exchange of information with 17 more jurisdictions under the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement on country-by-country reporting. After the update on 23 December 2016, the total number of active relationships of South Africa with other jurisdictions has had reached 27.²¹⁰

To address base erosion and profit shifting (BEPS), South Africa is a member of the Inclusive Framework on BEPS and participates in automatic exchange of information in tax matters. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analysts: Irina Popova and Alexander Ignatov

²⁰⁸ South Africa Increases Transfer Pricing Documentation Requirements, Thomson Reuters 11 November 2016. Access date: 12 January 2017. <https://tax.thomsonreuters.com/blog/checkpoint/South-Africa-Increases-Transfer-Pricing-Documentation-Requirements>.

²⁰⁹ South Africa, Switzerland agree to automatic exchange of information. Access date: 24 July 2017. <http://mnetax.com/south-africa-switzerland-agree-automatic-exchange-information-18241>

²¹⁰ Country-by-Country exchange relationships. Access date: 24 July 2017. <http://www.oecd.org/tax/beps/country-by-country-exchange-relationships.htm>

8. Regional Security: Afghanistan

“We affirm support to the efforts of the Afghan Government to achieve Afghan-led and Afghan-owned national reconciliation and combat terrorism, and readiness for constructive cooperation in order to facilitate security in Afghanistan, promote its independent political and economic course, becoming free from terrorism and drug trafficking.”

8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia		0	
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa	-1		
Total		-0.20	

Background

After more than three decades of bloodshed and regress, Afghanistan faces significant political, security and socio-economic challenges. Today, Afghanistan is one of the poorest countries in the world. Extreme rates of poverty and unemployment are aggravated by an increasing burden of corruption. Security risks also persist — the authorities have limited power outside Kabul, and several parts of the country are controlled by militant groups.

The BRICS leaders first expressed their commitment to promote peace and stability in Afghanistan in the 2012 Delhi Declaration.²¹¹ The commitment was reiterated at the 2013 Durban Summit, highlighting three major areas for potential engagement with Afghan authorities — security, economic development and good governance.

At the 2014 Fortaleza summit the BRICS leaders supported the commitment of the international community to remain engaged in Afghanistan during the transformation decade (2015-2024), as enunciated at the Bonn International Conference in December 2011. They stressed that the United Nations “should play an increasingly important role in assisting Afghanistan’s national reconciliation, recovery and economic reconstruction” and reaffirmed the commitment to “support Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism, and underscore the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilization of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.”²¹² At the 2015 Ufa Summit the BRICS leaders confirmed their readiness and called upon the international community “to remain engaged in Afghanistan and fulfill its long-term commitments on civilian and security assistance, including strengthening its security forces’ capability.”²¹³

²¹¹ 2012 Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre 29 March 2012. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>.

²¹² The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre. Access date: 22 August 2017. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

²¹³ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre. Access date: 22 August 2017. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

Commitment Features

Current challenges faced by Afghanistan are inextricably interconnected and deeply rooted into serious societal problems and lack of resources to tackle them. That is why overall support in security, economic, social and other spheres can trigger positive tendencies in country's development. All problematic issues in modern Afghanistan including terrorism and drug traffic fall within the local government's jurisdiction, thus support of BRICS members in addressing these problems manifests in the capacity-building actions providing Afghan government with resources and tools to combat them.

The commitment requires the BRICS members to provide capacity-building assistance to Afghanistan in security, socio-economic and governance spheres which will contribute to national reconciliation, fight with terrorism, security facilitation, promotion of independent political and economic course, and drug trafficking prevention.

The 2011 International Afghanistan Bonn Conference Communiqué outlines possible actions in each sphere.²¹⁴

Assisting the Afghan government in addressing security issues can include providing the Afghan National Security Forces, the Afghan National Army and the Afghan National Police with means to strengthen policing and justice systems to deter illegal and criminal activities, including terrorism and drug trafficking, supporting negotiations and reconciliation between national groups and political forces, and promoting regional and bilateral security treaties with Afghanistan's neighbors, etc.

Assistance in economic and social development can take the form of official development assistance, supporting infrastructure development, promoting education, healthcare, agriculture, energy, regional trade and transit agreements, etc.

Promoting good governance in Afghanistan may include sharing best practices and building Afghanistan's domestic capacity to deal with corruption, strengthening democratic institutions, promoting rule of law and supporting civil society organizations, engaging in dialogue with the Afghan government on human rights, and "promotion of civil society participation, including both traditional civil society structures and modern manifestations of civic action, including the role of youth, in the country's democratic processes."²¹⁵

In order to fully comply with this commitment, the BRICS members must assist Afghanistan by providing support in all of the following areas: combating security issues, facilitating economic development, and promoting good governance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member does not provide assistance to Afghanistan in addressing security, socio-economic and governance challenges.
0	Member provides assistance to Afghanistan in addressing only one or two of the following challenges: security, socio-economic development or good governance.
+1	Member provides assistance to Afghanistan in addressing all of the following challenges: security, socio-economic development and good governance.

²¹⁴ Afghanistan and the International Community: From Transition to the Transformation Decade, European Union External Action 5 December 2011. http://eeas.europa.eu/afghanistan/docs/2011_11_conclusions_bonn_en.pdf.

²¹⁵ Afghanistan and the International Community: From Transition to the Transformation Decade, European Union External Action 5 December 2011. http://eeas.europa.eu/afghanistan/docs/2011_11_conclusions_bonn_en.pdf.

Brazil: -1

Brazil has not complied with the commitment on regional security.

Brazil has taken no actions individually to support Afghanistan during the compliance period. However, more than 20 agencies of the United Nations, where Brazil has been regularly elected as a non-permanent member to the Security Council since its first session in 1946, are present in Afghanistan, working to support Afghans through a broad spectrum of humanitarian activities.²¹⁶

Brazil did not provide assistance to Afghanistan in addressing security, socio-economical governance challenges. Thus, it receives a score of -1.

Analyst Sofia Streltsova

Russia: 0

Russia has partly complied with the commitment on regional security.

On 27 December 2016, Russia hold a trilateral meeting with representatives of China and Pakistan, devoted to deterioration of interior situation in Afghanistan due to activities taken by several terrorist groups including ISIS cells.²¹⁷

On 7 February 2017, Sergey Lavrov, foreign minister of Russia, held a meeting with his Afghan counterpart Salahuddin Rabbani. High officials discussed a long range of issues concerning peace process in Afghanistan and cooperation between two countries. Lavrov stressed that Russia is devoted to support Afghanistan in preserving interior peace and security and provide assistance in war on terror. He also expressed sympathy for victims of recent avalanches in Afghan regions.²¹⁸

On 15 February 2017, Russia hosted six-party talks on Afghan issues in Moscow. The meeting was attended by high rank officials of Russia, Afghanistan, China, India, Iran and Pakistan. The meeting was devoted to joint actions to support intra-Afghan peace process. The parties acknowledged the leading role of Kabul in the process and stressed the importance of cooperation for peace in the country.²¹⁹

On 14 April 2017, Russia has hosted 11-party talks on security issues of Afghanistan in Moscow. The talks gathered together delegates from India, China, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Pakistan, Iran and Afghanistan. The parties discussed possible joint actions aimed at establishing peace and security in the country. The participants addressed the Taliban and claimed the organization to join the negotiation process.²²⁰

Russia has made progress in providing assistance to Afghanistan in security and good governance spheres, but lagged behind in supporting the country in socio-economic aspect. Russia took active

²¹⁶ Afeganistão: após expulsão do Talibã, ONU diz que apoio a Kunduz permanece 'essencial', Nações Unidas no Brasil 4 November 2016. Access date: 16 February 2017. <https://nacoesunidas.org/afeganistao-apos-expulsao-do-taliba-onu-diz-que-apoio-a-kunduz-permanece-essencial/>

²¹⁷ Press release on trilateral consultations on Afghanistan in Moscow. Access date: 2 March 2017. http://www.mid.ru/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/ckNonkJE02Bw/content/id/2580783

²¹⁸ Russia Ready to Help Afghanistan in Peace, Security. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://www.tolonews.com/afghanistan/russia-ready-help-afghanistan-peace-security>

²¹⁹ Press release on six-party consultations on Afghanistan in Moscow. Access date: 2 March 2017. http://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/ckNonkJE02Bw/content/id/2642417

²²⁰ Russia Gives Green Light To Host Afghan Peace Talks. Access date: 18 July 2017. <http://www.tolonews.com/afghanistan/russia-gives-green-light-host-afghan-peace-talks>

actions in facilitating multilateral actions on fight against terrorism and demonstrated support for the Government of Afghanistan in its interior practices. On the other hand, no actions aimed at economic assistance to Afghanistan were taken by the Russian side.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on regional security.

On 26 November 2016, India delivered the Afghan Air Force the last of the four attack helicopters Mi-25. India began the deliveries of Mi-25s in December 2015 as part of a strategic partnership agreement signed between the country and Afghanistan in 2011. Despite the fact of the delay, India managed to provide assistance to Afghanistan in the area of security.²²¹

On 4 December 2016, Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi made a speech at the 6th conference of Heart of Asia, which is a platform created in order to aid Afghanistan. He claimed that providing help to Afghanistan is “a critical unfinished mission of our time” and promised on behalf of the Indian people to continue assisting Afghanistan and helping the country to reach peace, stability and prosperity.²²²

On 3 February 2017, the Indian Government facilitated the visa policy for citizens of Afghanistan. The Indian Embassy informed that the duration of a tourist visa was increased to one year with continuous stay of 90 days during each visit. New visa agreement is also aimed at helping Afghans to maintain business and personal contacts with Indian counterparts contributing to the development and tightening of economic ties between the countries and increasing opportunities for Afghan economic recovery.²²³

On 15 May 2017, India has held a parliamentary forum with Afghanistan on natural resource management in New Delhi. The forum was devoted to best practices that can be approbated in Afghanistan to fight against illegal mining and make the process of revenue generation more transparent. The participants also anticipated the great impact of security factor in further development of economy of Afghanistan.²²⁴

India provides Afghanistan assistance in all three key areas: security, socio-economic development and good governance.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Evgeny Tsarik

²²¹ India delivers fourth Mi-25 attack helicopter to Afghanistan, IHS Jane's 360 05.12.2016 Access date: 17.02.2017.

<http://www.janes.com/article/65961/india-delivers-fourth-mi-25-attack-helicopter-to-afghanistan>

²²² PM Narendra Modi Reaffirms India's Support To Afghanistan, Times Now 04.12.2016 Access date: 17.02.2017.

<http://www.timesnow.tv/india/article/pm-narendra-modi-reaffirms-indias-support-to-afghanistan/52608>

²²³ India eases visa policy for Afghans, The Indian EXPRESS 03.02.2017 Access date: 17.02.2017.

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-eases-visa-policy-for-afghans-4506024/>

²²⁴ Afghan Parliamentarian Forum in India on Natural Resource Management. Access date: 31 July 2017.

<http://www.germancooperation-afghanistan.de/en/news/afghan-parliamentarian-forum-india-natural-resource-management>

China: 0

China has partly complied with commitment on regional security.

On 5 November 2016, China and Afghanistan have reached several important agreements concerning exploitation of natural resources of Afghanistan. Agreements cover the matters of copper deposits of the country. Speculating on the examples of previous Chinese resource projects, it is possible that all necessary expenses and construction works would be led by Chinese side on the basis of a concession agreement. Deepening economic cooperation between China and Afghanistan would provide Afghanistan with proper infrastructure and new sources of income.²²⁵

On 12 November 2016, China hosted a meeting with military representatives of Afghanistan, Pakistan and Tajikistan, where issues concerning antiterrorist actions were discussed. Earlier four parties agreed to form an alliance against terrorism; this meeting was the first one of a new international body. The parties agreed to share information, take joint actions against terrorist activity and strengthen their potential for peace and security of the region.²²⁶

On 14 November 2016, China announced its intention to build 10 more crossing checkpoints on the border between Tajikistan and Afghanistan. Under the China-Tajikistan agreement signed on the 1st of October, 2016, China would build 10 new border objects including one training facility, five crossing checkpoints, five frontier posts and three commandant's offices. All construction works would be completed by Chinese specialists.²²⁷

On 1 December 2016, China expressed its commitment to hold a trilateral meeting with representatives of Pakistan and Afghanistan on joint economic corridor. The project would promote international economic cooperation between three countries that is the matter of highest priority for further economic stabilization of Afghanistan.²²⁸

On 2 December 2016, China suggested build two new railway conjunctions that would connect Afghanistan and Pakistan with a large scale regional grid. The proposal includes construction of two new conjunctions Kabul — Peshawar and Kabul — Quetta. Both conjunctions would increase countries transport and transit capabilities.²²⁹

On 22 December 2016, The Chinese government pledged to provide humanitarian assistant including tents, blankets and other kinds of non-food supplies to Afghan locals. The packages were distributed to returnees in 19 out of 34 provinces of the country. The aid is expected not only to support the locals, but also strengthen ties between the two countries.²³⁰

²²⁵ Afghanistan and China to reach an agreement on exploitation of natural resources deposits. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://afghanistantoday.ru/hovosti/afganistan-kitay-dostigli>

²²⁶ Afghanistan, China, Pakistan and Tajikistan to strengthen cooperation on fight against terrorism. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://afghanistan.ru/doc/104404.html>

²²⁷ China to build 10 checkpoints on Tajik-Afghan border. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://afghanistantoday.ru/hovosti/kitay-nameren-postroit-dlya>

²²⁸ Beijing to propose meeting between the PRC, Afghanistan and Pakistan on economic corridor. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://www.afghanistantoday.ru/vazhnye/pekin-predlagaet-vstrechu-mezhdu>

²²⁹ China urges Afghanistan to build Kabul-Peshavar and Kabul – Quetta railways. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://afghanistantoday.ru/hovosti/kitay-predlozhit-afganistanu>

²³⁰ China provides humanitarian aid to Afghanistan. Access date: 2 March 2017. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2016-12/22/content_27742488.htm

On 27 December 2016, a trilateral meeting of representatives of Russia, China and Pakistan was held in Moscow. Parties discussed deterioration of interior situation in Afghanistan due to activities taken by several terrorist groups including local ISIS cells.²³¹

On 25 January 2017, China and Afghanistan have achieved an agreement on continuation of the scholarship programs for Afghan students wanted to study in China. Last year the Chinese government agreed to provide 50 study grants under Bilateral program (21 scholarships granted in 2016 will be prolonged this year; 29 are free for applicants) and another 50 grants under China Afghanistan Communication Scholarship Program.²³²

On 15 February 2017, Russia hosted six-party talks on Afghan issues in Moscow. The meeting was attended by high rank officials of Russia, Afghanistan, China, India, Iran and Pakistan. The meeting was devoted to joint actions to support intra-Afghan peace process. The parties acknowledged the leading role of Kabul in the process and stressed the importance of cooperation for peace in the country.²³³

On 20 February 2017, the first out of two special batches of Chinese humanitarian aid was delivered to Afghanistan. The government of China supported Afghanistan after demolishing avalanches stricken the country and caused more than 200 casualties.²³⁴

On June 2017, China has formally initiated a mediation bid to settle disputes between Afghanistan and Pakistan. China urges the parties to focus on joint fight against terrorism and struggle for regional peace.²³⁵

China took active measures aimed at providing Afghanistan with proper economic assistance and also participated in multilateral discussion on security in the country. On the other hand, China hasn't provided support for Afghanistan in the sphere of good governance practices.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: -1

South Africa has not complied with the commitment on regional security.

South Africa has taken no actions to support Afghanistan during the compliance period.

South Africa has not provided assistance to Afghanistan in addressing any of the following challenges: security, socio-economic development and good governance. Thus, it receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Elizaveta Nekrasova

²³¹ Press release on trilateral consultations on Afghanistan in Moscow. Access date: 2 March 2017.

http://www.mid.ru/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/ckNonkJE02Bw/content/id/2580783

²³² Information on Chinese Government Scholarship. Access date: 2 March 2017. <http://af.china-embassy.org/eng/sgxx/Notices/t1433758.htm>

²³³ Press release on six-party consultations on Afghanistan in Moscow. Access date: 2 March 2017.

http://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/news/-/asset_publisher/ckNonkJE02Bw/content/id/2642417

²³⁴ China sends first batch of humanitarian aid to Afghanistan after avalanche deaths. Access date: 2 March 2017.

<http://watsupasia.com/news/china-sends-first-batch-of-humanitarian-aid-to-afghanistan-after-avalanche-deaths/>

²³⁵ China Begins Mediation Bid to Ease Afghanistan-Pakistan Tensions. Access date: 25 July 2017.

<https://www.voanews.com/a/china-begins-mediation-bid-ease-afghanistan-pakistan-tensions/3914869.html>

9. Climate Change: Natural Gas

“We support a wider use of natural gas as an economically efficient and clean fuel to promote sustainable development as well as to reduce the greenhouse emissions in accordance with the Paris Agreement on climate change.”

8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.80		

Background

The BRICS first commitment to fight climate change dates back to the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, where the leaders pledged to “support international cooperation in the field of energy efficiency” and expressed readiness to engage in “a constructive dialogue on how to deal with climate change based on the principle of common but differentiated responsibility, given the need to combine measures to protect the climate with steps to fulfill our socio-economic development tasks.”²³⁶

Since then the BRICS have maintained climate change as an integral agenda item, committing to support international efforts to combat its effects and immediate causes.

However, the Goa Declaration represented the first time the BRICS leaders addressed the topic of natural gas promotion as “economically efficient and clean fuel.”²³⁷

The BRICS leaders referral to natural gas as an economically efficient and clean fuel is backed by international organizations’ assessments. According to the IEA data in 2014 global CO₂ emissions resulting from natural gas combustion totaled around 6.4 billion tonnes, while those for its most widespread alternatives — oil and coal amounted to 10.9 billion tonnes and 14.9 billion tonnes, respectively.²³⁸ Thus, natural gas has comparatively lower environmental impact than the energy sources, which it usually substitutes.

In 2014, according to the IEA statistics, coal constituted the largest part of energy mix in China (66.0%), India (45.8%) and South Africa (69.4%). Oil was the most widely used source of energy in Brazil, where it accounted for 42.1%. Only in Russia natural gas accounted for more than a half of primary energy supply (52.2%).²³⁹

²³⁶ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries' Leaders, BRIC 16 June 2009. Access date: 22 November 2016.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>.

²³⁷ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS 16 October 2016. Access date: 22 November 2016.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>.

²³⁸ CO₂ Emissions from Fuel Combustion 2016 Edition, IEA 2016. Access date: 3 may 2017.

http://www.iea.org/bookshop/729-CO2_Emissions_from_Fuel_Combustion.

²³⁹ Statistics, IEA. Access date: 4 May 2017. <http://www.iea.org/statistics/statisticssearch//>

Commitment Features

The pledge to expand the use of natural gas is central to the commitment. This expansion implies extending the territorial breadth of the use of natural gas as a primary energy source. Thus, promoting the use of natural both domestically and abroad was chosen as the primary criterion for the assessment.

The commitment can be fulfilled by both taking domestic actions and promoting international cooperation or providing support to foreign economies in the field of natural gas exploration, transportation or distribution, as well as introducing related technologies and practices, including those aimed at increasing energy efficiency and reducing environmental impact.

To achieve full compliance members must take both domestic and international action to promote wider use of natural gas.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member did not take actions aimed at expanding the use of natural gas.
0	Member took action aimed at expanding the use of natural gas either domestically or abroad.
+1	Member took action aimed at expanding the use of natural gas both domestically and abroad.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on climate change and energy efficiency.

On 11 November 2016, the executives of Brazilian state oil company Petrobras and Bolivian counterpart YPF signed a treaty for a USD 1.2 billion natural-gas exploration venture in southern Bolivia. Furthermore, their meeting in Santa Cruz brought an accord to study hydroelectric projects possibility on the Madera River.²⁴⁰

On 2 December 2016, it was announced that scholars from Brazil and the United States developed a new device aimed at reducing energy losses in buildings due to assessment of the energy performance of windows “without removing them from their site.” This project called Portable Window Energy Meter is still in prototype stage is a part of the U.S.-Brazil Strategic Energy Dialogue Program, the key objective of which is joint energy and science cooperation and clean energy technologies proliferation to reduce energy use in buildings and double energy productivity by 2030.²⁴¹

On 13 January 2017, Minister of Mines and Energy Fernando Coelho Filho announced that the government expected to raise between BRL 3.5 billion and BRL 4.5 billion with the completion of the 14th round of bidding for oil and natural gas exploration blocks and the second Round of block auctions in the pre-salt, under the production sharing regime. It was stated that the government had

²⁴⁰ Petrobras signs US\$ 1.2bn contract for natural gas exploration in southern Bolivia, South Atlantic News Agency MercoPress 11.11.2016. Access date: 15.02.2017. <http://en.mercopress.com/2016/11/11/petrobras-signs-us-1.2bn-contract-for-natural-gas-exploration-in-southern-bolivia>.

²⁴¹ U.S.-Brazil Collaboration Leads to Innovative Device That Reduces Energy Use in Buildings, the US Energy Department Official Website 02.12.2016. Access date: 15.02.2017. <https://energy.gov/eere/articles/us-brazil-collaboration-leads-innovative-device-reduces-energy-use-buildings>.

the schedule of actions for the year 2017 and was collaborating to have onshore bidding done in May.²⁴²

18 May 2017, the Energy and Mineral Sector Technical Assistance Project, Project Meta, was extended from 30 June 2017 to 31 December 2018. The initiative is the result of a partnership between the Brazilian government and the World Bank initiated in 2012. The extension meets the new guidelines for the sectors and supports the country's competitiveness and sustainable economic growth. With investments of USD 53 million, the program contains 19 subprojects and provides for the inclusion of 22 others. Among the new proposals included is the "Gás para Crescer" ("Gas to Grow") initiative, launched in 2016, which will open the natural gas market.²⁴³

Brazil has taken actions aimed at expanding the use of natural gas both domestically and abroad. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Sedova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on climate change and energy efficiency.

On 18 October 2016, the Agency for Strategic Initiatives, Delovaya Rossiya, the Federal Customs Service and the Russian Export Service signed a document aimed at facilitating proper framework for non-oil and gas exporting companies. Cooperation agreement launches a pilot project that would help the chosen companies during export and import procedures.²⁴⁴

On 23-25 November 2016, the 5th International forum on energy efficiency and energy-saving energy development ENES was held by the Moscow Government and the Ministry of Energy of the Russian Federation in Moscow. The topics for discussion were energy efficiency and the sustainable development of energy with a focus on social and environmental factors. One of the topics concentrated on the question of interaction of natural gas producers and final consumers. Representatives from Gazprom and the heads of power-generation and heat-supply companies participated in a roundtable discussion.²⁴⁵ Also, at the initiative of Andrey Nikitin, Director General of the Agency for Strategic Initiatives, there was a discussion on improving energy supply in distant and low-populated areas. The agency proposed creation of a register of solutions and technologies that will improve access to energy grids in remote areas.²⁴⁶

²⁴² ANP oil exploration auctions may raise R \$ 4.5bn in 2017, blog 13.01.2017. Access date: 15.02.2017.

<https://brazilenergyinsight.com/2017/01/13/anp-oil-exploration-auctions-may-raise-r-4-5bn-in-2017/>.

²⁴³ Projeto atenderá às novas diretrizes para os setores de energia e mineração, Portal of Brazilian Government 18 May 2017. Access date: 26 July 2017. <http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2017/05/projeto-atendera-as-novas-diretrizes-para-os-setores-de-energia-e-mineracao>

²⁴⁴ 10 Non-oil and gas companies will pick up systemic support during export and import procedures. Access date: 10 March 2017. <https://asi.ru/eng/news/60870/>

²⁴⁵ Draft business program of the Fifth International forum on energy-efficiency and energy-saving energy development ENES 2016. Access date: 9 March 2017. http://enes-expo.ru/docs/enes2016/Download_the_program_2016_25-11-2016-1.pdf

²⁴⁶ Breakthrough technologies will reach the most remote corners of Russia. Access date: 9 March. <https://asi.ru/eng/news/61964/>

On 2 June 2016, Russia and Iran signed a roadmap on cooperation in energy sphere. On the sidelines of the St. Petersburg Economic Forum the parties discussed a wide range of issues including cooperation in oil and gas industries.²⁴⁷

On 23 June 2017, the Government of the Russian Federation has issued the order no. 727 on amendments to the governmental acts concerning gas supply and gas infrastructure development. The order is aimed at further improvement of regulating procedures in gas sphere. New regulations limit powers of federal and local authorities in control of efficient use of natural gas and thus simplify access of infrastructure facilities to gas grids.²⁴⁸

At this moment, Russia has taken action aimed mostly at domestic consumption of natural gas. The government supported further dialog on important issues in this sphere between producers and gas consumers. Also, some initiatives aimed at promoting actions of national gas exporting companies took place. In addition, Russia has taken feasible actions to facilitate use of natural gas in foreign countries by means of constructing new transport facilities for gas export.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on climate change and energy efficiency.

On 8 November 2016, Tata Motors Ltd, the largest manufacturer in Indian automotive industry, demonstrated the country's first liquefied natural gas (LNG) powered bus in Kerala. Indian Oil Corp. and Petronet LNG Ltd., state-owned companies, cooperate with Tata Motors Ltd. to launch the buses fuelled by LNG, which is cleaner and cheaper than diesel. The companies started the test run of the first such bus in Thiruvananthapuram, the capital of Kerala, in line with the government's intent to create a gas-based economy.²⁴⁹

On 29 November 2016, The Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas and Ministry of Skill Development & Entrepreneurship signed a memorandum of understanding to increase skill development initiatives and to expand sources of skilled workforce in the petroleum, natural gas, hydrocarbon and related sectors among other areas of cooperation.²⁵⁰

On 30 November 2016, the NITI Aayog, Columbia University's Center on Global Energy Policy and the Confederation of Indian Industry held a high-level workshop for discussing natural gas in India attended by. Shri Dharmendra Pradhan, Indian Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas, Christopher Smith, Assistant Secretary for Fossil Energy, U.S. Department of Energy and Dr. Arvind Panagariya, Vice Chairman, Niti Aayog, India. It also brought together a small, select group of senior

²⁴⁷ Roadmap for Russia-Iran energy cooperation signed. Access date: 18 July 2017.

<https://minenergo.gov.ru/node/8236>

²⁴⁸ The government signed an order on improvement of access procedure to gas facilities. Access date: 18 July 2017.

<https://minenergo.gov.ru/node/8524>

²⁴⁹ Tata Motors showcases country's first LNG-powered bus, Tata Motors Ltd 8 November 2016. Access date: 12

February 2017. <http://www.tatamotors.com/press/tata-motors-showcases-countrys-first-lng-powered-bus/>

²⁵⁰ Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas and Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship sign MoU to boost to skill initiatives in the Hydrocarbon Sector, Press Information Bureau 29 November 2016. Access date: 12 February 2017. <http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=154503>

policymakers, regulatory experts, private sector executives and research scholars to discuss the future of the Indian gas market.²⁵¹

On 23 January 2017, India's Oil and Natural Gas Company, the government-owned oil and gas corporation, and Bangladesh Petroleum Corporation discussed the possibility to build the 6,900 km long gas pipeline that will be linking Bangladesh, Myanmar and northeastern states. The two countries are seeking to extend their energy cooperation to Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.²⁵²

On 13 April 2017, India has announced that a bilateral treaty on cooperation in gas sphere has had being signed during an official visit of the Prime Minister of India to Bangladesh. The agreement sets conditions for massive infrastructure building in the territory of Bangladesh with a view to increase gas and diesel supply.²⁵³

On 11 July 2017, India's biggest state-run carbon recycling company Indian Oil Corporation Ltd. and LanzaTech in the United States signed an agreement on building the first refinery off gas-to-bioethanol facility in the world. The agreement falls behind the state program aimed at increasing the total efficiency of renewables in India with lesser impact on ecology.²⁵⁴

India has taken actions aimed at expanding the use of natural gas both domestically and abroad. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Maria Strelnikova

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on climate change and energy efficiency.

On 19 October 2016, Philippines agreed to cooperate with China in exploitation of prospective oil and gas deposits in the area closed to Recto Bank (internationally known as Reed Bank). Despite the fact that both countries claims the region as territory under their national jurisdiction, parties managed to finalize an agreement.²⁵⁵

On 7 November 2016, China and Pakistan have reached an agreement on construction of regasified liquefied natural gas in the Gwadar port. The total sum of the project is USD315-340 million. The terminals will be able to regasify 1.2 billion cubic feet of natural gas per day, providing USD25 million tolling fee per year.²⁵⁶

²⁵¹Global Energy Dialogue: India and Natural Gas; The Joining Together of Plentiful Supply with Promising Demand on November 30, 2016, The India Energy Portal (IEP) 30 November 2016. Access date: 12 February 2017. <http://www.indiaenergy.gov.in/event1.php>

²⁵²India, Bangladesh negotiate gas pipeline, The New Indian Express 23 January 2017. Access date:12 February 2017. <http://www.newindianexpress.com/nation/2017/jan/23/india-bangladesh-negotiate-gas-pipeline-1562721.html>

²⁵³India to build diesel, gas pipelines to Bangladesh. Access date: 27 July 2017. <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/industry/energy/oil-gas/india-to-build-diesel-gas-pipelines-to-bangladesh/articleshow/58163942.cms>

²⁵⁴IOC, LanzaTech ink Rs 350-cr pact to build first off gas-to-bioethanol unit. Access date: 27 July 2017. http://www.business-standard.com/article/companies/ioc-lanzatech-ink-rs-350-cr-pact-to-build-first-off-gas-to-bioethanol-unit-117071001274_1.html

²⁵⁵PH to agree on joint oil exploration with China in disputed sea. Access date: 10 March 2017. <http://business.inquirer.net/216959/ph-to-agree-on-joint-oil-exploration-with-china-in-disputed-sea>

²⁵⁶China to build two RLNG terminals at Gwadar. Access date: 10 March 2017. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/163013-China-to-build-two-RLNG-terminals-at-Gwadar>

On 23 November 2016, Ahsan Iqbal, Planning Minister of Pakistan, says China has invested extra amounts of money under conditions of joint Pakistan-China Economic Corridor project. According to the announcement, Beijing has invested an extra USD8.5 billion into improving the main railway of Pakistan from Karachi to Peshawar and towards the construction of lines for transporting liquified natural gas and a new terminal. Introduction of new components of gas using grids would provide regions of Pakistan with proper electric capacity preventing local rotating blackouts.²⁵⁷

On 22 December 2016, China's largest state-owned energy company, Sinopec (China Petroleum & Chemical Corporation), announced its plan to increase use of natural gas during the heating season. The company plans to sell up to 10 billion cubic meters of natural gas, which would be a 27% increase in comparison to the last year (7.89 billion cubic meters in 2015). China's domestic consumption is not met by its own production which means that total amount of gas import of the country will increase in months to come.²⁵⁸

On 5 January 2017, the National Energy Administration and the National Development and Reform Commission have released the 13th Five-Year Energy Plan of the Peoples Republic of China. Concerning the usage of natural gas, China plans to raise percentage of energy mix devoted to natural gas up to 10% in 2020 from less than 6% in 2015. Increase of total domestic gas exploitation and development, further deregulation of gas market in order to increase efficiencies in the value chains, better access to infrastructure and promotion of use of natural gas as a substitute for coal and oil on transport are also on the list of the plan's priorities.²⁵⁹

China has managed to maintain both domestic and international vectors of policy aimed at broader access to natural gas-based energy.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment on climate change and energy efficiency.

On 22 November 2016, Integrated Energy Plan and an Integrated Resource Plan were released. Energy minister Tina Joemat-Pettersson told that these documents are aimed at establishing integrated framework for gas, liquid fuels and electricity to attract potential investors.²⁶⁰

On 9 December 2016, Cabinet supported the Minister of Transport, Dipuo Peters, to allow the Strategic Fuel Fund to handle cargoes of Liquefied Petroleum Gas at the Port of Saldanha Bay. The Strategic Fuel Funds license would be extended with a minimum of 25 years to provide commercial and operational certainty for sustainable investment in the oil and gas sector.²⁶¹

²⁵⁷ Pakistan says China to make extra \$8.5 billion investments in rail, energy. Access date: 10 March 2017.

<http://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-pakistan-economy-cpec-idUKKBN1311Y2?il=0>

²⁵⁸ Mainland moves to use more natural gas, China daily 22 December 2016. Access date: 3 April 2017.

http://europe.chinadaily.com.cn/business/2016-12/22/content_27740603.htm

²⁵⁹ China targets almost doubling of natural gas consumption by 2020. Access date: 10 March 2017.

<https://www.medianet.com.au/releases/122890/>

²⁶⁰ Gas is pivotal to South African 2050 Energy Plan, Natural Gas World 22.11.2016. Access date: 27.02.2017

<http://www.naturalgasworld.com/gas-is-pivotal-to-south-african-2050-energy-plan-34567>

²⁶¹ Statement on the Cabinet meeting of 7 December 2016, South African Government 9.12.2016. Access date:

27.02.2017 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/statement-cabinet-meeting-7-december-2016-9-dec-2016-0000>

On 19 December 2016, Ravi Pillay on behalf of the Premier of the Province of KwaZulu-Natal Willies Mchunu invited potential investors to consider Richards Bay Industrial Development Zone for investments. Richards Bay was selected to host the lion's share of 2000 Megawatts of the 3600 megawatts allocated to gas power plants as part of the gas Independent Power Producer project.²⁶²

On February 9, 2017 South African President Jacob Zuma announced that the country would continue developing renewable energy sources, including natural gas, by expanding the Power Producer Programme.²⁶³

South Africa has taken action aimed at expanding the use of natural gas domestically. Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Elizaveta Nekrasova

²⁶² MEC Ravi Pillay on behalf of Premier Willies Mchunu: State of the Continent Address media briefing, South African Government 19.12.2016. Access date: 27.02.2017 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/mec-ravi-pillay-state-continent-address-media-briefing-19-dec-2016-0000>

²⁶³ President Jacob Zuma: 2017 State of the Nation Address, South African Government 9.02.2017. Access date: 27.02.2017 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/president-jacob-zuma-2017-state-nation-address-9-feb-2017-0000>

10: Information and Communications Technologies

“We affirm our commitment to bridging digital and technological divides, in particular between developed and developing countries.”

8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration

Assessment

	No compliance	Partial compliance	Full compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00		

Background

The BRICS first turned their attention to the development of information and communication technologies (ICT) at their 2013 meeting in Durban. The leaders recognized “the critical positive role the Internet plays globally in promoting economic, social and cultural development.”²⁶⁴ In 2014 the BRICS leaders reaffirmed their vision of ICT as a means to foster sustainable economic progress and social inclusion and agreed “that particular attention should be given to young people and to small and medium-sized enterprises, with a view to promoting international exchange and cooperation, as well as to fostering innovation, ICT research and development.”²⁶⁵

2015 Ufa declaration emphasized that “ICTs are emerging as an important medium to bridge the gap between developed and developing countries.”²⁶⁶ It also recognized “the potential of developing countries in the ICT ecosystem” and acknowledged that [they] “have an important role to play in addressing the ICT-related issues in the post-2015 development agenda.” In 2015 the decision was made to create BRICS working group on ICT cooperation. During the 2016 Goa summit BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to ICT expansion as a key to enable sustainable development, international peace and security and human rights.²⁶⁷ In the Goa Summit declaration BRICS members also committed to “bridging digital and technological divides, in particular between developed and developing countries.”

Commitment Features

“Digital divide” refers to the gap between individuals, households, businesses and geographic areas at different socio-economic levels with regard both to their opportunities to access information and communication technologies (ICTs) and to their use of the Internet for a wide variety of activities.”²⁶⁸

²⁶⁴ eThekweni Declaration, BRICS 27 March 2013. 19 October 2015. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>.

²⁶⁵ Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS 15 July 2014. 19 October 2015. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>.

²⁶⁶ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration Ufa, Russia, July 9, 2015, BRICS Information Center University of Toronto. Access date: 4 April 2017. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

²⁶⁷ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration Goa, India, October 16, 2016, BRICS Information Center University of Toronto. Access date: 4 April 2017. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

²⁶⁸ Understanding the Digital Divide, OECD. Access date: 18 April 2017. <https://www.oecd.org/sti/1888451.pdf>

The commitment requires the BRICS members to take actions aimed at promoting universal access to digital communication inside the country as well as taking particular steps to bridge digital and technological divide between developed and developing countries. In the ICT Ministers' meeting communiqué of 2015, parties "resolved to work together to share best practices, skills and promote investment in these areas to achieve these goals" and also "consider it necessary to promote measures and facilitate favorable conditions for ensuring the progressive development of ICTs. These measures and conditions include factors such as the equitable use of security measures relating to the continuity and stability of the use of ICTs in all spheres of life and production."²⁶⁹ Possible government actions on promoting universal access to digital communication inside the country can include investing in expanding broadband capabilities and increasing broadband coverage through either directly investing in building appropriate infrastructure and facilities or supporting/creating favourable conditions for private initiatives and enterprises in this sphere. The governments' actions to bridge the digital divide between developed and developing countries can involve information technologies' transfer, organization of joint seminars and conferences on the topic of ICT with participants from developing countries, signing cooperation agreements with developing countries, expertise sharing etc.

To fully comply with the commitment members should take actions to both expand access to digital communication technologies inside the country and help bridge digital divide with developing countries.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member fails to take action to expand access to digital communication inside the country and bridge the digital divide with developing countries.
0	Member takes action to expand access to digital communication inside the country OR to bridge the digital divide with developing countries
+1	Member takes action to expand access to digital communication inside the country AND to bridge the digital divide with developing countries.

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on information and communications technology (ICT).

On 10-11 November 2016, Brazilian and European representatives held the IX Brazilian-European Dialogue on Information Society (the "Sector Dialogues" project conducted by governments) in Brussels, Belgium. The representatives discussed "the construction of a submarine cable to connect Brazil and Europe, ICT regulation, government policies in cloud computing, digital strategies and the cooperation program in research and development." The submarine cable is in the contracting phase, and, according to the plan, will be implemented in the first half of 2017.²⁷⁰

²⁶⁹ Official Communiqué of the Meeting of BRICS ICT Ministers Was Published, Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation 23 October 2015. Access date: 18 April 2017. <http://minsvyaz.ru/en/events/34194/>.

²⁷⁰ Brazil and European Commission discuss science and technology focused on innovation, La Asociación Red Nacional de Educación e Investigación website 23 November .2016. Access date: 15 February 2017. <https://www.rnp.br/en/noticias/brazil-and-european-commission-discuss-science-and-technology-focused-on-innovation>.

On 17 November 2016, a joint agenda on nanotechnology, biotechnology and technology parks between Brazil and Iran was agreed with the aim of boosting bilateral cooperation between the two countries. The document defines, as a mutual interest, to explore research and development possibilities in ICT, such as hardware, software, cybernetic policies, cognitive computing and the development and exchange of knowledge in technology parks.²⁷¹

On 18 July 2017, the Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovation and Communications launched a public call to select a thousand telecenters from all over the country to participate in the National Training Program for Digital Inclusion. This programme aims to contribute to the universalization of digital culture in the country by encouraging the training of professionals in Information and Communication Technologies.²⁷²

On 18 July 2017, it was announced that the New National Connectivity Plan will be put on public consultation in August. The plan reviews the public policies aimed at expanding Internet access in the country, replacing the National Broadband Program.²⁷³

On 20 July 2017, the Minister of Science, Technology, Innovation and Communications, Gilberto Kassab, participated in the opening of a workshop on telecommunications promoted by the Federation of Industries of the State of São Paulo (Fiesp). At the event, government representatives, telecom operators and technology companies discussed changes in the General Telecommunications Law and the resumption of investments in the sector, with new policies for broadband expansion in the country.²⁷⁴

Brazil has taken actions aimed both at expanding access to digital communication technologies inside the country and at bridging digital divide with developing countries. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sofia Streltsova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on information and communications technology (ICT).

On 5-9 December 2016, the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) Third Session of Ministerial Conference on Transport took place in Moscow. The Russian side presented by the Ministry of transport of the Russian Federation opened a question concerning joint actions of ESCAP countries aimed at promoting wider use of ERA-GLONASS

²⁷¹ Brasil e Irã aprofundam cooperação em ciência e tecnologia, IDEA Consultores 18 November 2016. Access date: 18 April 2017. <http://www.ideaconsultores.com.br/brasil-e-ira-aprofundam-cooperacao-em-ciencia-e-tecnologia/>

²⁷² Telecentros têm até 18 de agosto para participar do programa de formação de agentes de inclusão digital, Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovation and Communications of Brazil 18 July 2017. Access date: 26 July 2017.

http://www.mcti.gov.br/noticia/-/asset_publisher/epbV0pr6eIS0/content/telecentros-tem-ate-18-de-agosto-para-participar-do-programa-de-formacao-de-agentes-de-inclusao-digital;jsessionid=3765E8BF9851B8AA78D948E0F537EA32.rima

²⁷³ Plano nacional de conectividade deve ser colocado em consulta pública em Agosto, Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovation and Communications of Brazil 18 July 2017. Access date: 26 July 2017. http://www.mcti.gov.br/noticia/-/asset_publisher/epbV0pr6eIS0/content/plano-nacional-de-conectividade-deve-ser-colocado-em-consulta-publica-em-agosto

²⁷⁴ Ministro participa de workshop sobre telecomunicações nesta sexta-feira na Fiesp, Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovation and Communications of Brazil 20 July 2017. Access date: 26 July 2017. http://www.mcti.gov.br/noticia/-/asset_publisher/epbV0pr6eIS0/content/ministro-participa-de-workshop-sobre-telecomunicacoes-nesta-sexta-feira-na-fiesp

navigation system on transport. The point was mentioned in the official statement of Russia and widely discussed by the participants. Russia's actions towards promotion of navigation technologies were mentioned in the Report of the Ministerial Conference on Transport on its third session.²⁷⁵

On 13 December 2016, Russia and Iran held a forum devoted to cooperation in the sphere of high technologies and transport in Tehran. Two countries agreed to work on wider technological exchanges. The meeting was organized by the Roskongress Foundation.²⁷⁶

On 1 June 2017, Russia has adopted an agreement for bridging digital divide of regions of the country. The agreement was signed by ICT Minister N. Nikiforov, President of Rostelekom M. Oseevsky, governors of Kurgan, Tyumen and Bryansk regions. The agreement is aimed at providing better access to digital communications in the regions of Russia.²⁷⁷

Russia has taken actions aimed at bridging digital divide with developing countries and expanding access to digital communication technologies inside the country.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on information and communication technology (ICT).

On 14-27 November 2016, the 36th India International Trade Fair took place in New Delhi on the theme of "Digital India." It was an initiative of the Government of India with the vision to transform India into a digital empowered society and knowledge economy. The fair was visited by 52 foreign trade delegations from over 45 countries, including leaders of trade and industry, foreign dignitaries, decision makers, policy makers and opinion makers.²⁷⁸ Furthermore, the India Trade Promotion Organization for the first time introduced online space booking system that enabled participants across countries and states to book space of their choice by paying online through the use of payment gateways.²⁷⁹

On 14 December 2016, the Delhi Airport announced that it launched e-shopping platform that allows passengers shop online through their mobile phones.²⁸⁰

On 3 January 2017, Hindustan Coca-Cola Beverages Pvt. Ltd (HCCBPL), State Bank of India (SBI) and Coca-Cola India Pvt. Ltd., declared a strategic partnership to allow over 2.6 million retailers and 5000 distributors to conduct business transactions digitally. Arundhati Bhattacharya, SBI Chair, and T. Krishnakumar, HCCBPL Chair and Chief Executive Officer, signed the Memorandum of

²⁷⁵ Report of the Ministerial Conference on Transport on its third session. Access date: 9 March 2017.

http://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/pre-ods/MCT3_12E.pdf

²⁷⁶ Russia and Iran intend to cooperate in the sphere of high technologies and develop transportation and logistics flows. Access date: 9 March 2017. <https://asi.ru/eng/news/62798/>

²⁷⁷ Four-party agreement on bridging digital divide under reform of USO was signed. Access date; 31 July 2017.

<http://minsvyaz.ru/ru/events/36943/>

²⁷⁸ India Trade Fair, India Trade Promotion Organization. Access date: 15 February 2017. <http://indiatrdefair.com/iitf/>

²⁷⁹ IITF 2016: The Digital Trade Fair, Press Information Bureau 22 November 2016. Access date: 15 February 2017.

<http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=154019>

²⁸⁰ Delhi airport launches e-shopping platform, The Hindu 14 December 2016. Access date: 15 February 2017.

<http://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/Delhi/Delhi-airport-launches-e-shopping-platform/article16802463.ece>

understanding, which entails initiating the digitization process with retailers by onboarding them into the SBI's digital payment options such as Buddy P2P, Buddy Merchant App, SBI Pay. To aid a smooth transition process, along with SBI-authorized trainers, Coca-Cola will provide training to the retailers on new and developing digital business transaction solutions.²⁸¹

On 9-10 January 2017, the 20th National Conference on e-Governance, the key e-Governance event in India organized by Department of Administrative Reforms and Public Grievances and Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology, Government of India in partnership with Information Technology, Electronics and Communication Department, Government of Andhra Pradesh took place at Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh.²⁸²

On 10-13 January 2017, the 8th Vibrant Gujarat Global Summit, which was held by the government of Gujarat in Gujarat, India, with the central focus on "Sustainable Economic and Social Development" took place at Mahatma Mandir, Gandhinagar. The Indian information technology services industry was one of the focus sectors along with aerospace and defence, engineering, healthcare, agro and food processing, etc. The summit brought together heads of various states and governments, ministers, leaders from the corporate world, senior policy makers, heads of international institutions and academia from around the world to further the cause of development and to promote cooperation.²⁸³

On 11 January 2017, India and the United States signed a memorandum of understanding (MOU) between the Indian Computer Emergency Response Team under India's Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology and the U.S. Department of Homeland Security on cooperation in the field of cyber security. The MoU intends to foster closer co-operation and the exchange of information related to cyber security in accordance with the relevant laws, rules and regulations of each economy and on the basis of equality, reciprocity and mutual benefit.²⁸⁴

India has taken actions aimed both at expanding access to digital communication technologies inside the country and at bridging digital divide with developing countries. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Maria Strelnikova

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on information and communications technology (ICT).

²⁸¹Hindustan Coca-Cola Beverages Pvt. Ltd., State Bank of India & Coca-Cola India partner towards Digital Solutions & Literacy Initiative, Coca-Cola India 3 January 2017. Access date: 15 February 2017. <https://www.coca-colaindia.com/hindustan-coca-cola-beverages-pvt-ltd-state-bank-india-coca-cola-india-partner-towards-digital-solutions-literacy-initiative/>

²⁸²Two-day 20th National Conference on e-Governance concludes in Visakhapatnam, Press Information Bureau 10 January 2017. Access date: 15 February 2017. <http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=156267>

²⁸³Vibrant Gujarat Global Summit 7 February 2017. Access date:14 February 2017. <https://vibrantgujarat.com/index.htm>

²⁸⁴India-CERT Signs an MoU with US-CERT, Press Information Bureau 11 January 2017. Access date: 15 February 2017. <http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=156288>

On 15 November 2016, China and Malawi have signed an agreement granting a loan of USD 23 million to improve access to the Internet in the African country. The agreement grants money for further improvement of fiber infrastructure of the Malawi National Fibre backbone.²⁸⁵

On 19-22 December 2016, the Israeli ICT Roadshow to China was held in Beijing, Nanjing, Shanghai and Jinan. All those events were jointly sponsored by China Science and Technology Exchange Center, affiliated with the Ministry of Science and Technology, Jiangsu Department of Science and Technology, Shanghai Municipal Science and Technology Commission, Department of Science and Technology of Shandong Province and Beijing Municipal Science and Technology Commission and co-organized by Jiangsu Center of International Technology Transfer, Shanghai Science and Technology Development and Exchange Center and Shandong Provincial Foreign Science and Technology Exchange Center. Those events brought representatives of 14 Israeli companies to China in order for them to demonstrate their technologies and projects in ICT, including Internet of Things positioning and mobile edge computing platforms. The roadshow promoted international science and technology cooperation between Israel and Chinese localities and induced industry technology cooperation and joint research and development (R&D) among innovative enterprises from Israel and Chinese enterprises.²⁸⁶

On 15-17 November 2016, the International Technology Transfer Convention 2016 was held in Beijing International Convention Center. It was hosted by the Ministry of Science and Technology of People's Republic of China and Beijing Municipal People's Government. The general motto of the convention was "openness in innovation, sharing for the greater good" and the organizers of the convention focused on four topical issues: new generation information technologies, green development, health industry and wide bandgap semiconductor. More than 20 events were organized: from seminars and promotions to country forums.²⁸⁷

On 1 December 2016, the 42nd Session of China-Czech Science and Technology Cooperation Committee was held in Prague. At the meeting, the two sides exchanged their opinions and reached wide consensus on deepening the bilateral cooperation in science and technology innovation as well as in the other topics. They agreed to strengthen bilateral dialogue on strategic policy, fully leveraging the "16+1" cooperation platform, incorporating other science and technology-related research institutions, government departments, universities and local science and technology management departments in both countries, and continuously enriching bilateral cooperation in science and technology innovation. The two sides also reached an agreement upon increasing inputs into joint R&D, expanding cooperation and exchanges between their research personnel, actively implementing the Memorandum of Understanding on Support of Joint Research and Development signed between

²⁸⁵ Parliament to approve Chinese K16.5 bn loan to improve internet. Access date: 31 July 2017.
<http://www.nyasatimes.com/parliament-approve-chinese-k16-5-bn-loan-improve-internet/>

²⁸⁶ Israeli ICT Roadshow Held in Nanjing, Shanghai, Jinan & Beijing, Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China 13 February 2017. Access date: 1 March 2017
http://www.most.gov.cn/eng/pressroom/201702/t20170213_130896.htm

²⁸⁷ China (Beijing) International Technology Transfer Convention 2016 Successfully Held, Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China 23 December 2016. Access date: 01 March 2017
http://www.most.gov.cn/eng/pressroom/201612/t20161223_129791.htm

the two countries and witnessed there by their heads of state, building joint laboratories and R&D centres and establishing platforms for bilateral technology and science cooperation.²⁸⁸

On 5 December 2016, the 7th Session of China-Hungary Science and Technology Cooperation Committee was held in Budapest, the capital of Hungary. During the meeting, the Chinese side briefly described the latest progress in science and technology innovation and shared the information on the deepening of science and technology program management reforms, promotion of in-depth combination of science and technology with the economy and multiple attempts to implement international cooperation in science and technology in China. The Chinese side also paid special attention to the successful convening of the G20 Science, Technology and Innovation Ministers Meeting and the First China-Central and Eastern European Countries Conference on Innovation Cooperation. The Hungarian side briefed the Chinese side on Hungary's research management system, innovation policy on science and technology, current status of R&D, development goals and future fields for priority development. The Hungarian side also presented the Chinese side its international cooperation in science and technology, which includes Hungary participating in the European Union's Horizon 2020 and construction of large-scale research infrastructure.²⁸⁹

On 21 November 2016, Vice Minister Yin Hejun of the Ministry of Science and Technology had a meeting with a visiting Iranian delegation which was led by Vahid Ahmadi, Deputy Minister for Research and Technology. The two sides exchanged their views and reached consensus on pushing forward bilateral cooperation in innovation, science and technology. Yin stressed out that collaboration in science and technology is an integral part of the China-Iran relations and both sides have been committed in supporting exchanges and cooperation in the fields of information technology, nanotechnology and science parks. He also said that China is going to promote substantive collaboration with Iran, expand personnel exchanges between the two countries, explore mechanisms to use joint research funding, and promote pragmatic cooperation in science and innovation on a bilateral basis.²⁹⁰

China has taken actions aimed both at expanding access to digital communication technologies inside the country and at bridging digital divide with developing countries. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Kirill Gribkov

South Africa: +1

South Africa member has fully complied with the commitment on information and communications technology (ICT).

²⁸⁸ 42nd Session of China-Czech S&T Cooperation Committee Held in Prague, Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China 10 January 2017. Access date: 01 March 2017
http://www.most.gov.cn/eng/pressroom/201701/t20170110_130375.htm

²⁸⁹ 7th Session of China-Hungary Science and Technology Cooperation Committee Held in Budapest, Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China 10 January 2017. Access date: 01 March 2017
http://www.most.gov.cn/eng/pressroom/201701/t20170110_130373.htm

²⁹⁰ Vice Minister Yin Met Iranian Deputy Minister for Research & Technology, Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China 22 December 2017. Access date: 01 March 2017
http://www.most.gov.cn/eng/pressroom/201612/t20161222_129757.htm

On 18 February 2017, the Deputy Minister of Communications, Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams, conducted a digital terrestrial television awareness outreach. During this event, the pilot group received set top boxes, which widen and improve access to high-quality television.²⁹¹

On 19 February 2017, the Minister of Communications and Postal Services Dr. Siyabonga Cwele led consultations on the implementation of the National Integrated ICT Policy White Paper. This event was held in the context of government restructuring of the ICT sector. As it was stated, the government successfully implements the new ICT Policy.

On 15-17 November 2016, Cape Town, South Africa, hosted the AfricaCom on implementation and spreading of communication technologies in the African region.²⁹²

On 5-9 December 2016, Minister Siyabonga Cwele headed the South African delegation at the 11th Internet Governance Forum held in Mexico. The Forum brought together both private and public sector representatives throughout the world in order to facilitate the exchange of ideas and best practices between stakeholders of different levels.²⁹³

South Africa has taken actions aimed both at expanding access to digital communication technologies inside the country and at bridging digital divide with developing countries. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Elizaveta Nekrasova

²⁹¹ Ngqeleni community to receive digital terrestrial television, SABC, 18.02.2017. Access date: 09.03.2017. <http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/4ad61f80401e5ddfaadfeb75889f6f7e/Ngqeleni-community-to-receive-digital-terrestrial-television-20171802>

²⁹² Speakers, 20th Anniversary Africa Com. Access date: 28.02.2017. <https://tmt.knect365.com/africacom/speakers>

²⁹³ Minister Cwele To Attend The Internet Governance Forum 2016 And Undertake A Benchmarking Study In Mexico, Telecommunications and Postal Services, 5.12.2016. Access date: 09.03.2017. https://www.dtps.gov.za/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=665:minister-cwele-to-attend-the-internet-governance-forum-2016-and-undertake-a-benchmarking-study-in-mexico&catid=13&Itemid=138